# A Pastoral Approach to Juvenile Prostitution in Canada

by

Deborah Rapport

A Thesis submitted to the Faculty of Knox College and the Pastoral Department of the Toronto School of Theology In partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Theology awarded by Knox College and the University of Toronto

## A Pastoral Approach to Juvenile Prostitution in Canada

#### Deborah Rapport

#### Master of Theology

#### Knox College and the University of Toronto

2016

#### **Abstract**

This thesis paper examines the current and historical realities of juvenile prostitution in Canada and outlines a response embracing pastoral, practical, and missional elements. The paper explores several risk factors which increase the likelihood for entry into the sex trade, the realities for those involved in the sex trade, and the Canadian legal context. Next, the paper presents the formulation of a pastoral, practical, and missional response to these realities, which includes both understanding the Church's historical approach towards the sex trade while simultaneously moving the Church response from one of stigmatization and apathy to a response of understanding embrace. The paper argues that the fostering of resiliency in ministry with youth mitigates against risk factors. It asserts that it is necessary for the Church to reach out in love to empower sexually exploited young people in practical ways, and presents a framework for how to do this pastoral work.

## Acknowledgments

Thank you to my thesis advisor Dr. Nam-Soon Song for her guidance, wisdom and encouragement. I wish to acknowledge and express gratitude to Brooklyn and the amazing women I have had the honour of journeying with through ARISE Ministry. I am grateful to my colleagues, friends, and family for all their patience and encouragement. I am especially grateful to my sister Kim Stanbury, my dear friend Rhiannon Maton and my loving husband Joshua Rapport, whose unwavering support and love encouraged me onward.

#### Table of Contents

# CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCING A PASTORAL APPROACH TO JUVENILE PROSTITUTION ......1 THE SIGNIFICANCE OF PURSUING A PASTORAL RESPONSE TO JUVENILE PROSTITUTION IN 3 STRUCTURE: THE CONVERSATION BETWEEN HUMAN EXISTENCE AND DIVINE 1. A Brief Ethnographic Portrait 6 Cheyenne's Story ......6 1.1 Connecting the Personal with the Literature .......8 Entry Age ......9 School Experiences 19 Government Institutions 20 3.3. The Role of Pimps 29

4.4.	Influence of the Nordic model	44
4.5.	The Protection of Communities and Exploited Persons Act (Bill C-36)	45
СНАРТЕ	CR 3: TOWARDS A PASTORAL, PRACTICAL AND MISSIONAL	
RESPON	SE	48
1. AF	Pastoral Portrait	48
1.1.	ARISE Ministry and Brooklyn's Story	48
1.2.	Responding to Brooklyn's Story	50
2. RE	SPONSE OF THE CHURCH: FROM "OTHER" TO EMBRACE	50
2.1.	Historical Theological Response to Prostitution	52
2.2.	Challenging Apathy	53
2.3.	From Rescue to Embrace	55
2.4.	Missio Dei and Embracing the "Other"	56
3. Fo	STERING RESILIENCY THROUGH YOUTH MINISTRY	57
3.1.	Relationships and Resiliency	59
3.2.	Skill-based Spiritual Formation	61
3.3.	Encouraging Greatness	63
3.4.	Purpose and Opportunity	65
3.5.	Missio Dei and Resiliency Minded Youth Ministry	66
4. <b>O</b> U	TREACH: REACHING OUT IN LOVE	68
4.1.	A Practical Understanding of Outreach	69
4.2.	Qualities of Effective Outreach.	72
4.3.	Outreach as Living out Missio Dei	74
5. EM	POWERED AND TRANSFORMED: EXITS AND AFTER-CARE	75
5.1. ]	Motivation for Change	76
5.2.	The Power of Shame	78
5.3.	A Community of Embrace	79
5.4.	Missio Dei, Transformation and Empowerment	81
СНАРТЕ	CR 4: CONCLUDING THOUGHTS	83
1. Co	NCLUSIVE REMARKS	83
2. GA	PS IN THE RESEARCH: GENDERED RESEARCH	84
3. Но	PE FOR THE FUTURE IN COUNTERING JUVENILE PROSTITUTION IN CANADA	84
DIDI IOC	TD A DHV	Q.

# Chapter 1 Introducing a Pastoral Approach to Juvenile Prostitution

#### Juvenile Prostitution in Canada

Over the past several years, Canadian news headlines have reflected a growing concern with the exploitation of young people through the sex trade. Headlines have read: "Human trafficking probe involving 31 young girls leads to 10 arrests;" "Ottawa police rescue 15- and 16-year-old girls who had been forced into sex trade;" and "Seven underage sex workers identified in Halifax as part of national operation." These headlines reveal a problem in Canada involving the sex trafficking and sexual exploitation of minors. Youth across Canada are being sexually exploited for the purposes of prostitution.

Prostitution can broadly be defined as the remuneration in cash or exchange for sexual services.<sup>4</sup> The commercial sex trade extends beyond street level prostitution to include massage brothels, escorting, outcalls, strip clubs, lap dancing, phone sex, pornography, child prostitution, sex trafficking, and prostitution tourism.<sup>5</sup> Young people are frequently recruited for the commercial sex trade, and recruiters often target minors under the age of 18 who are legally considered juveniles. Juvenile prostitution refers to the commercial sexual exploitation of minors, and encompasses both child and adolescent prostitution. Aforementioned headlines show that

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Jessica Smith Cross, "Human trafficking probe involving 31 young girls leads to 10 arrests," *Toronto Metro* (February 19, 2014), http://www.metronews.ca/news/toronto/2014/02/19/human-trafficking-probe-involving-30-young-girls-leads-to-10-arrests.html (accessed January 29, 2016).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Metro, "Ottawa police rescue 15- and 16-year-old girls who had been forced into sex trade," *Ottawa Metro* (June 24, 2015), http://www.metronews.ca/news/ottawa/2015/06/24/ottawa-police-rescue-15-and-16-year-old-girls-who-had-been-forced-into-sex-trade.html (accessed January 29, 2016).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Haley Ryan, "Seven underage sex workers identified as part of national operation," *Halifax Metro* (October 8, 2014), http://www.metronews.ca/news/halifax/2014/10/08/seven-underage-sex-workers-identified-in-halifax-as-part-of-national-operation html (accessed Jan 29, 2016)

part-of-national-operation.html (accessed Jan 29, 2016).

A Richard Volpe, Shruti Talwar, and Ari Hunter, *Juvenile "Prostitution" in Toronto* (Toronto: Sexual Exploitation Education and Awareness Coalition of Toronto, 2006), 6;

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Melissa Farley, Ann Cotton, Jacqueline Lynne, Sybille Zumbeck, Frida Spiwak, Maria E. Reyes, Dinorah Alvarez, and Ufuk Sezgin, "Prostitution and Trafficking in Nine Countries: An Update on Violence and Posttraumatic Stress Disorder," *Journal of Trauma and Practice* 2, no. 3/4 (2003): 34.

juvenile prostitution is not isolated to one city or even province. The prostitution of minors is a shocking reality in Canada today.<sup>6</sup>

Pastoral theology strives to provide care to people in need.<sup>7</sup> In this paper, I argue that this care must be extended thoughtfully and strategically to young people exploited in the commercial sex industry. Pamela Couture states, "The central work of pastoral or congregational care is care for the most vulnerable persons in society, poor children." When applied to the problem of juvenile prostitution in Canada, Couture's statement suggests that young people in the sex trade require the care and concern of the Church. The question driving this paper is: how should pastoral theology respond to the problem of juvenile prostitution in Canada? This paper first discusses the realities of juvenile prostitution in Canada and then explores how pastoral theology might respond to those realities.

# 2. The Significance of Pursuing a Pastoral Response to Juvenile Prostitution in Canada

The Canadian laws surrounding prostitution were in a state of flux in 2013 when the proposal for this thesis was submitted and I began to embark upon the writing of this paper. At that time, the Supreme Court of Canada was challenged to strike down the prostitution laws held as unconstitutional. Many predicted that this challenge would result in the legalization of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Volpe, Talwar, and Hunter, *Juvenile "Prostitution" in Toronto*, 19; Special Committee on Pornography and Prostitution (Canada), *Pornography and Prostitution in Canada: Report of the Special Committee on Pornography and Prostitution* (Ottawa: Minister of Supply and Services Canada, 1985), 372; Jannit Rabinovitch, "PEERS: The Prostitutes' Empowerment, Education and Resource Society," in *Prostitution, Trafficking and Traumatic Stress*, ed. Melissa Farley, (Binghamton: Haworth Maltreatment & Trauma Press, 2004), 240; Task Force on Trafficking of Women and Girls in Canada, *From Heartbreaking to Groundbreaking: Stories and Strategies to End Sex Trafficking in Canada* (Toronto: Canadian Women's Foundation, 2014), 3.

http://canadianwomensfoundation.uberflip.com/i/395419-cwf-traffickingreport-donor-en-uberflip (accessed December 19, 2015).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Bonnie J. Miller-McLemore, "The Contributions of Practical Theology," in *The Willey-Blackwell Companion to Practical Theology*, ed. Bonnie J. Miller-McLemore (Malden: Willey-Blackwell, 2012), 6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Pamela Couture, *Seeing Children, Seeing God: A Practical Theology of Children and Poverty* (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 2000), 13.

prostitution in Canada and there was a great deal of concern that the implications of legalization were not well understood in the Church or in broader Canadian society, and neither were the potential risks posed to children and youth. During the writing of this thesis, Bedford et al vs. the Attorney General of Canada was ruled upon, the Conservative government introduced The Protection of Communities and Exploited Persons Act (Bill C-36), and the Liberal government led by Justin Trudeau was elected. The realities of juvenile prostitution in Canada are significant and highly relevant social and legal concerns. The laws surrounding prostitution in Canada continue to be in a state of transition.

Canada has a dearth of organizations working to support juveniles who have been exploited in the commercial sex trade. In 2013, Sharon Oselin and Ronald Weitzer published a paper on their search for prostitute serving organizations across both Canada and the United States. This search highlighted 37 prostitute serving organizations across both countries. After examining each organization's goals, they categorized the organizations into four categories: Radical Feminist, Sex Work, Youth Oriented and Neutral. Youth Oriented organizations were those that focused on underage prostitutes who lack the capacity to consent; they seek to facilitate youth exiting prostitution and protect them from exploitation. Out of the 37 organizations that the search revealed, only five were deemed "Youth Oriented," and all of these five were located in the United States. At the time, Canada did not have a single youth oriented organization dedicated to serving young people involved in the sex trade. Oselin and Weitzer recognized in their research that other organizations may exist but they were unable to find any information on

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Sharon S. Oselin and Ronald Weitzer, "Organizations Working on Behalf of Prostitutes," *Sexualities* v. 16 n. 3/4 (2013): 447.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>ì0</sup> Ibid., 447, 448.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Ibid., 450.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Ibid., 450.

them. 13 The lack of available information on youth oriented prostitute serving organizations in Canada suggests a gross lack of care available to exploited young people.

Pastoral theology and pastoral care must be seen in the context of *missio Dei*, that is God's mission at work in the world. Missio Dei is God's self-revelation as one who loves the world and its people. 14 Pastoral and congregational care must be understood as the Church's participation in God's mission. The messianic mission of Christ and the Spirit involves liberation. 15 Pastoral theology in response to and participation in God's mission must respond to juvenile prostitution in Canada.

#### 3. Structure: The Conversation between Human Existence and Divine Manifestation

This thesis is a literature review, which aims to explore how practical theology can respond to the issue of juvenile prostitution in Canada. This review utilizes the revised correlation method advanced by Paul Tillich. Of this method, Tillich stated:

The following system is an attempt to use the "method of correlation" as a way of uniting message and situation. It tries to correlate the questions implied in the situation with the answers implied in the message... It correlates the questions and answers, situation and message, human existence and divine manifestation.<sup>16</sup>

Tracy and Browning later modified Tillich's methods and applied them to practical theology in the revised correlation method. This method called for a mutual critical correlation between questions and answers as two-sided, with theology and the social sciences conversing as

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> David J. Bosch, Transforming Mission: Paradigm Shifts in Theology of Mission (Maryknoll: Orbis Books, 1991),

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Jürgen Moltmann, The Church in the Power of the Spirit: A Contribution to Messianic Ecclesiology, trans. Margaret Kohl (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1993), 60.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Paul Tillich, Systematic Theology: Volume 1 (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1951), 8.

equals. <sup>17</sup> The revised correlation approach involves the conversation between the questions posed by the situation and the answers theology can provide. This thesis is structured in such a way that the first part defines the situation, examines human existence, and raises questions about the realities of juvenile prostitution in the Canadian context. In conducting this research, I used combinations of several key terms: "juvenile," "prostitution" and "Canada." Other terms utilized were: "adolescent," "youth," "sex trade," "sex work" and "Toronto." The second part is a conversation between the situation and the message, the manifestation of the divine, and the answers therein

The second chapter is titled, "Understanding Juvenile Prostitution in Canada," and in it I describe three aspects of juvenile prostitution in Canada. First, I present the situational factors that increase a young person's risk of sexual exploitation. Second, I provide an overview of subtrades within the sex industry and discuss the significance of health concerns, pimps and johns on the lives of sex workers. I also provide an international comparison. Third, I outline the changing legal context in Canada surrounding prostitution and the ways these changes impact sexually exploited young people.

The third chapter is titled, "Towards a Pastoral, Practical and Missional Response." In it, I present a pastoral response to the realities presented in second chapter. I explore the historical response of the Church to prostitution and present a resiliency-minded understanding of youth ministry as a preventative model against risk factors. I argue that outreach informed by pastoral theology is necessary for empowering young people who are involved in the sex trade through supporting them in their own journey toward personal transformation.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Mark Hestenes, "The early Browning: Pastoral Care in a pluralistic age and the method of practical moral inquiry," HTS Teologies Studies/Theological Studies 68, no. 2 (2012): 2.

http://www.hts.org.za/index.php/HTS/article/viewFile/1211/2374 (accessed December 12, 2015)

# Chapter 2 Understanding Juvenile Prostitution in Canada

## A Brief Ethnographic Portrait

The facts about juvenile prostitution in Canada can seem overwhelming and leave readers with a tendency to depersonalize the stories and to detach. The facts and statistics reflect the real, lived experiences of exploited individuals and this should not be forgotten or overlooked. Providing effective pastoral care to the individual necessitates seeing, hearing, and understanding the personal lived experiences, and thus I pose an ethnographic depiction at the beginning of this chapter in order to ground the subsequent facts and statistics in the personal lived experience of one young woman.

The following story is an amalgamation of multiple stories and stems from both the scholarly literature and my own experience providing pastoral care to individuals involved in the sex trade, where I have had the privilege of hearing many personal stories. Common aspects among these varied narratives have been observed and are supported by research, statistics and literature. This ethnographic depiction speaks to the common experiences of Canadian women in the sex trade and functions to personalize their lived realities.

## 1.1 Cheyenne's Story

Cheyenne was born on a First Nations Reserve in Northern Ontario. Her grandparents suffered the abuse of Residential Schools. The women in her family were all survivors of childhood incest, a secret everyone knew but nobody spoke about. All the adults in her family struggled with significant substance addictions, and primarily alcoholism. At 6 years old, Cheyenne was frequently left to take care of her younger siblings and cousins while the adults drank. If the younger children made too much noise, Cheyenne's father's angry fists would come flying

towards them and Cheyenne would throw herself in front of the punches, taking the brunt of his abuse. She preferred angry fists to the incestuous rape that later followed. When Cheyenne was 9 years old she drank windshield washer fluid in an attempt to end her life. Child protection services and the police were called in to investigate. Her father was arrested, and Cheyenne and her siblings were removed from their home and placed in different foster homes. Her foster care placement also meant a new school, and it became evident that Cheyenne was academically far behind her peers. Other kids at school would pick on her and tell her she was stupid. Cheyenne would sometimes try to run away from her foster placement and return to the Reserve. She was moved to a group home while her worker tried to arrange family visits. Her family made it clear that they blamed Cheyenne for her father's incarceration and her mother's hospitalization from a recent over-dose. The bullying and name-calling at school intensified, and when another girl said to Cheyenne, "No wonder your parents didn't want you, you're ugly and stupid," it cut to the core and sent Cheyenne into a blind rage. Cheyenne was expelled from school.

On what was to be her first day back to school, Cheyenne decided she could not bear to face the other kids, so instead she hitched a ride to Toronto. She arrived as a hungry and homeless 12-year old, mesmerized by the tall buildings and bright lights of the big city, an easy target for any predator. She scraped together the little bit of change from her pockets and hoped it was enough to order off the value menu at McDonalds. While sitting in a booth at McDonalds, a young man in his early 20s approached her. In Cheyenne's eyes, he was the most attractive guy she had ever seen and she could not believe he was talking to her. She opened up to him about her past and her fears, they talked for hours. When it was revealed that Cheyenne had nowhere to stay, he invited her back to his apartment. He told her she was beautiful, so mature for her age, that he longed to be with her and would never hurt her the way her father had. When he kissed her and

told her he loved her in the morning light, she believed having sex with him was her choice. He showered her with gifts and attention, she would do anything he said, and by the end of the week he and his friends had put an advertisement for her online and had her working in the sex trade.

## 1.2. Connecting the Personal with the Literature

There are a number of factors that pose threat to a young person's life and increase the threat of sexual exploitation. As an ethnographic depiction, Cheyenne's story points to many of these risk factors. Gender, age, and race are not risk factors on their own. When combined with home experiences of physical, sexual, emotional abuse, and/or various forms of childhood maltreatment, the risk of exploitation greatly increases. Lack of school engagement, involvement with child protection agencies, and homelessness combine in unique ways to create serious environmental hazards. When these various risk factors combine, as they did in Cheyenne's life, juvenile prostitution may occur. These risk factors will be explored and examined more fully in the section that follows.

## 2. Recognizing Risks

The literature points to common experiences, characteristics and indicators that increase the risk of juvenile sexual exploitation and prostitution. These experiences, characteristics and indicators are risk factors for the sexual exploitation of young people. Such hazards are beyond the control of the child or youth who is labelled "at risk." Conceptually, the term "at risk" draws attention to the environmental hazards that need to be addressed, while avoiding blaming the child or youth

for factors beyond their control.<sup>18</sup> These hazards are often interconnected and when combined pose risk for increased vulnerability to the individuals involved.

The scholarly literature conceptualizes the risk of involvement in the sex trade according to specific criteria. These include: age, gender, race, socio-economic status, adverse childhood experiences, abuse, homelessness, school experiences, and involvement with child protection services. Understanding risk factors is necessary for designing and implementing a proactive and preventative pastoral response.

## 2.1. Entry Age

Childhood is a time of vulnerability as youth come to learn about themselves and the world around them. Young people have no control over their age, and without the protection and care of trusting adults, the youth and innocence of children may be exploited. Entry age is significant for understanding how juvenile prostitution relates to the sex trade in Canada. Research consistently shows that juvenile recruitment is the dominant reality in Canada, and whether the young person is working in escort services, skin flicks, strip joints, massage parlours, or the street corners, most stated they entered prostitution between the ages of 13 to 18. 19 Sex work in Canada is rarely an adult choice; it frequently begins with the abuse and exploitation of children.

The average age of entry into prostitution in Canada has become younger over the past 30 years. The 1985 report of the Minister of Supply and Services Canada, states, "While there is evidence that some prostitutes started as young as 10 or 12, this appears to be exceptional and it is more likely that young people engage in the business from the age of 15 or 16 on." Twenty years

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Larry K. Brendtro, Martin Brokenleg and Steve Van Bockern, *Reclaiming Youth At Risk: Our Hope for the Future*, Revised Ed. (Bloomington: Solution Tree, 2002), 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Volpe, Talwar, and Hunter, Juvenile "Prostitution" in Toronto, 19.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Special Committee on Pornography and Prostitution (Canada), *Pornography and Prostitution in Canada*, 372.

later, a Canadian study found, "80% turned their first trick before age 18, with some children as young as 8 years."<sup>21</sup> In their Fall 2014 report, the Canadian Women's Foundation stated that the most common recruitment age for Canadian prostitution was 13-14 years old.<sup>22</sup> This data shows the entry age into prostitution in Canada has become progressively younger since 1985.

Juvenile prostitution involves the commercial sexual exploitation of children and adolescents. Though both adolescent and child prostitution involve minors, there are differences between the two. Bagley differentiates adolescent prostitution from child prostitution in the following way:

Adolescent prostitutes (girls aged 13 and over) are sought because of their nubility and their newly acquired secondary sexual characteristics; the adolescent women involved usually emphasize their obvious sexuality. Child prostitutes (girls of around 12 or younger), in contrast, are taught to emphasize their innocence and their lack of secondary sexual development.<sup>23</sup>

According to Bagley, the difference between child and adolescent prostitution essentially rests with the purchaser, rather than in the extent or characteristics of the abuse.

In contrast, adult prostitution involves those 18 years of age or older, and implicitly includes a perception of choice and agency. However, in exploring the realities of prostitution such as average entry age, the role of pimps and traffickers, and various risk factors, the fallacy of assumptions about agency and choice becomes clear. Farley et al. show that distinguishing between juvenile and adult prostitution is not simple:

A qualitative distinction between prostitution of children and prostitution of adults is arbitrary and it obscures the lengthy and extensive history of trauma that is commonplace in prostitution....The 14-year-old in prostitution eventually turns 18 but she has not suddenly made a new "vocational choice."<sup>24</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Rabinovitch, "PEERS," 240.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Task Force on Trafficking of Women and Girls in Canada, From Heartbreaking to Groundbreaking, 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Christopher Bagley, "Adolescent prostitution in Canada and the Philippines: Statistical comparisons, an ethnographic account and policy options," International Social Work 42, no. 4 (1999): 447.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Melissa Farley, Ann Cotton, Jacqueline Lynne, Sybille Zumbeck, Frida Spiwak, Maria E. Reyes, Dinorah Alvarez, and Ufuk Sezgin, "Prostitution and Trafficking in Nine Countries: An Update on Violence and Posttraumatic Stress Disorder," Journal of Trauma and Practice 2, no. 3/4 (2003): 36.

Farley et al. show that juvenile prostitutes frequently continue to be involved in prostitution into their adulthood.<sup>25</sup> Thus, adult prostitutes cannot be assumed to hold full agency. Assumptions of choice based on age obscure the ways in which agency has been denied. Juvenile prostitution must be understood to be intricately and intrinsically related to the sex trade as a whole. Sex work in Canada should not be considered an adult choice.

#### 2.2. Gender/s

The over-representation of women and girls in the Canadian sex trade is reflected by the scholarly literature, which tends to predominantly focus on the trends and experiences of women and girls involved in prostitution in Canada. Research on street youth in Toronto found that "those in the sex trade were over-represented by females and youth who grew up in Toronto." This over-representation of females is not unique to street youth in Toronto. The International Labour Organization found that 98% of the victims of sex trafficking worldwide are female. <sup>27</sup>

In this paper, I focus on young women and girls involved in prostitution, given both the depth of research material to draw from and their over-representation in sex work. However, it is important to note that juvenile prostitution in Canada, and indeed the sex trade as a whole, is a risk for both boys and girls. Young men are also exploited through juvenile prostitution. There is evidence to suggest that boys enter prostitution earlier, at the age of 12, and stay involved in the sex trade for double the length of time as their girl counterparts.<sup>28</sup> It is also important to note that

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Stephen Gaetz and Bill O'Grady, "Making money: exploring the economy of young homeless workers," *Work, Employment and Society* 16, no. 3 (2002): 450.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> International Labour Organization, *21 Million People Are Now Victims Of Forced Labour, ILO Says*, (2012). http://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/newsroom/news/WCMS\_181961/lang--en/index.htm. (accessed December 19, 2015).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Volpe, Talwar and Hunter, Juvenile "Prostitution" in Toronto, 16.

in Canada, transgender<sup>29</sup> youth are also involved in prostitution, particularly transgender women (men to women). Juvenile prostitution in Canada is not limited to the exploitation of young women, however the focus of this paper primarily considers the sexual exploitation of girls.

## 2.3. Race and Poverty

Poverty is determined by insufficient access and stress in accessing resources and basic necessities. In Canada, it is estimated that 4.8 million people currently live in poverty.<sup>30</sup> Poverty and race are often linked to each other, as well as to one's place within society. Racial categorizations are deeply embedded and continuously perpetuated by inequitable social institutions and systems.<sup>31</sup> Nationality, ancestry, gender, culture and race often intersect and relate to each other, speaking not only to shared lived experiences but also shared histories of poverty.

Poverty in Canada is experienced in particular ways along racial lines. Issues surrounding social status, citizenship status and Treaty status can lead to a lack of or limited opportunities. Poverty, race, and status intersect in ways that perhaps most clearly and tragically impact Canada's Aboriginal communities. The over-representations of missing and murdered Aboriginal

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> The use of transgender follows that of Leslie Feinberg who originally used the word as an adjective and umbrella term for an imagined community composed of those who are marginalized or oppressed due to difference from standard social norms of gender embodiment. This term has come to be the common preferred terminology in scholarship and common language (Please see: Susan Stryker, "(De)Subjugated Knowledges: An Introduction to Transgender Studies," in *The Transgender Studies Reader*, ed. Susan Stryker and Stephen White (New York: Routledge, 2006), 4-6; Judith Halberstam, In a Queer Time and Place: Transgender Bodies, Subcultural Lives (New York: New York University Press, 2005), 21; GLAAD, "GLAAD Media Reference Guide – Transgender Issues," http://www.glaad.org/reference/transgender/ (accessed April 1, 2016); Katy Steinmetz, "Why It's Best to Avoid the Word 'Transgendered,'" Time (December 15, 2014), http://www.time.com/3630965/transgender-transgendered/ (accessed April 1, 2016); Leslie Feinberg, Transgender Liberation: A Movement Whose Time Has Come (Lexington: Women's International Network News Quarterly, 1992).

30 Canada Without Poverty, "Just the Facts," http://www.cwp-csp.ca/poverty/just-the-facts/ (accessed December 21,

john a. powell, "A History of Race and Power," [speech, St. John's Presbyterian Church, Berkeley, CA, November 5, 2014], quoted in Sara Grossman, "john powell: KPFA Evening Dialogue - A History of Race and Power," (November 6, 2014) http://diversity.berkeley.edu/john-powell-kpfa-dialogue-history-race-power (accessed July 13, 2015).

women,<sup>32</sup> and the historical refusal of former Prime Minister Stephen Harper to request an inquiry into their disappearance,<sup>33</sup> suggest that the disappearance of an Aboriginal girl and her subsequent exploitation in the sex trade are normalized and come with less risk to traffickers.

Race thus plays a factor in the recruitment and coercion of individuals exploited in the sex trade. Furthermore, there is market demand for people of particular races, which increases the profit to pimps. Racial prejudice is built into prostitution, and white girls are usually more profitable for pimps.<sup>34</sup> The sex trade is in many ways defined by race.

Canada's First Peoples have experienced a long and difficult history as a result of treaties and the reserve system, which has fostered impoverished economic conditions amongst many Aboriginal communities.<sup>35</sup> This impoverishment and trauma is further complicated by the inter-generational trauma caused by Residential Schools.<sup>36</sup> Gaetz and O'Grady noted an over-representation of Aboriginal and Metis youth involved in the sex trade.<sup>37</sup> Research with women in the Prairie Provinces who were involved in prostitution as adolescents showed that Aboriginal respondents were more likely to still be involved in the sex trade than Caucasian respondents.<sup>38</sup> Similarly, researchers found that of the 100 women involved in prostitution interviewed in Vancouver's

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> CBC News, "Aboriginal women still overrepresented among Canada's missing and murdered women," (June 19, 2015) http://www.cbc.ca/news/aboriginal/aboriginal-women-still-overrepresented-among-canada-s-missing-and-murdered-women-1.3120272 (accessed July 13, 2015).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Canadian Press, "Harper says no inquiry into missing and murdered aboriginal women," (October 6, 2015), http://www.news1130.com/2015/10/06/harper-says-no-inquiry-into-missing-and-murdered-aboriginal-women/ (accessed January 5, 2016).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Julian Sher, *Somebody's Daughter: The Hidden Story of America's Prostituted Children and the Battle to Save Them* (Chicago: Chicago Review Press, 2013), 4; Annie Lowrey, "In-Depth Report Details Economics of Sex Trade," *The New York Times* (March 12, 2014), www.nytimes.com/2014/03/12/us/in-depth-report-details-economics-of-sex-trade.html (accessed March 13, 2014).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> UN General Assembly, Human Rights Council, Twenty-seventh Session, Agenda item 3, *Report of the Special Rapporteur on the rights of indigenous peoples, James Anaya, on the situation of indigenous peoples in Canada*, prepared by James Anaya, (A/HRC/27/52/Add.2, 2014), 7-8, 16-17.

<sup>36</sup> Dawn Smith, Colleen Varcoe and Nancy Edwards, "Turning Around the Intergenerational Impact of Residential

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Dawn Smith, Colleen Varcoe and Nancy Edwards, "Turning Around the Intergenerational Impact of Residential Schools on Aboriginal People: Implications for Health Policy and Practice," *CJNR* 37, no. 4. (2005): 47. <sup>37</sup> Gaetz and O'Grady, "Making Money," 444.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Kendra Nixon, Leslie Tutty, Pamela Downe, Kelly Gorkoff and Jane Ursel, "The Everyday Occurrence: Violence in the Lives of Girls Exploited Through Prostitution," *Violence Against Women* v. 8, no. 9. (2002): 1022.

Downtown Eastside 52% of the participants were First Nations, in contrast with official documentation of local First Nations population at 1.7%-7%. The researchers suggested this was evidence of the "effects of colonization." However, this statement seems to oversimplify the lengthy and traumatic history of oppression of the First Peoples of Canada. The intergenerational trauma caused by a systematic cultural genocide, which included the elimination of language, family, and community through Residential Schools is profound. The lasting trauma and hurt caused continues to impact lives and communities today.

Unemployment also impacts opportunity, education, experience, stability, and status creating situations of poverty and economic desperation frequently associated with prostitution. Youth unemployment in particular can foster feelings of futility and a lack of meaningful options for young people. Gaetz and O'Grady found, "In Canada, for example, the problem of youth unemployment is greatest among aboriginals and young people living in rural/coastal communities."

All The lack of safe, secure, and affordable housing also creates risk as individuals seek to secure and maintain housing. In their summary of *Mean Streets: Youth Crime and Homelessness*, by Hagan and McCarthy, Volpe, Talwar and Hunter write, "Unemployment, shelter, time on the street and the number of times left home are significantly associated with prostitution. Prostitution increases with unemployment and problems associated with finding secure shelter."

The lack of opportunity and economic advancement through meaningful employment creates risks, particularly to rural, coastal, and indigenous communities.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Farley et al. "Prostitution and Trafficking in Nine Countries," 37-38.

<sup>40</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> The Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada, *They Came for the Children: Canada, Aboriginal Peoples and Residential Schools* (Winnipeg: The Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada 2012), 10-11, 22, 80.
<sup>42</sup> Ibid 45

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Gaetz and O'Grady, "Making Money," 444.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Volpe, Talwar and Hunter, *Juvenile "Prostitution" in Toronto*, 13.

#### 2.4. Home Experiences

Environmental stressors in childhood pose risk to health and wellbeing throughout the lifespan. Adverse experiences in childhood have been linked to a complexity of concerns. Childhood abuse places young people at increased risk of juvenile prostitution, homelessness, and sexual exploitation. Kagi and Regala state, "The Adverse Childhood Experiences (ACE) Study found powerful relationships between life stressors during the first 18 years and physical, emotional and behavioral health across the lifespan."<sup>45</sup> The higher the number of Adverse Childhood Experiences (ACE) score, the increased likelihood the individual was to have had 30 or more sexual partners and/or have contracted a venereal disease. 46 Higher ACE scores have also been linked to addiction, depression, and suicide attempts. 47 Adverse Childhood Experiences impact the sense of belonging a child feels towards the adults in their lives. The lack of belonging, connection, and wholeness can become internalized and lead to feelings of shame, thus impacting one's entire sense of identity. Ramsay explains:

Ordinarily, identity emerges as a child's natural needs are met in mutually significant caring relationships. An inner sense of wholeness, belonging, and connection develops through a reciprocal process of identification and differentiation. Shame ensues when a devastating experience of rupture breaks that interpersonal bridge with trusted adults and brings a consequent sense of betrayal and the unexpected exposure of unmet internal need 48

The need for belonging and the burden of shame can lead a young person to search for acceptance in ways that are distorted and/or destructive.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Ruth Kagi and Debbie Regala, "Translating the Adverse Childhood Experiences (ACE) Study Into Public Policy: Progress and Possibility in Washington State," Journal of Prevention and Intervention in the Community 40 (2012): 271.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> Shanta R. Dube, Vincent J. Felitti, Maxia Dong, Wayne Giles and Robert F. Anda, "The impact of adverse childhood experiences on health problems; evidence from cohorts dating back to 1900," Preventative Medicine 37 (2003): 270, 273. <sup>47</sup> Ibid., 272, 273

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> Nancy J. Ramsay, "Sexual Abuse and Shame: The Travail of Recovery," in Women in Travail and Transition: A New Pastoral Care, ed. Maxine Glaz and Jeanne Stevenson Moessner (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1991), 113.

The correlation between childhood abuse, particularly sexual abuse, and involvement in the sex trade has been well documented. Williamson and Prior found that 91% of the girls in their study involved in prostitution experienced childhood abuse in their homes.<sup>49</sup> Abuse in the home places young people at an increased risk for homelessness and street-involvement:

Compared to other homeless cohorts, the sex workers left home at a younger age, have been on the streets the longest, were the most likely to have grown up in at least one foster home, had the lowest educational credentials in the sample, reasons for leaving home were most likely physical and sexual assault.<sup>50</sup>

Abuse is rarely a singular event, but rather usually takes place in an abusive environment where a multitude of abuses are committed by more than one perpetrator. Of the Canadian respondents in one study, 84% stated that they had been sexually abused as children by five sexual abuse perpetrators on average. The research and literature on the Adverse Childhood Experiences (ACE) study observes the effect of sexual abuse by multiple perpetrators on development and various associated risks. The majority of individuals in the sex trade have experienced childhood sexual abuse.

Childhood abuse does not exist in a vacuum or as an isolated event. Research by Edwards et al. on Adverse Childhood Experiences observes that child abuse is often multi-category abuse in an environment where abuse is a constant:

Chaotic, emotionally abusive, or neglectful family situations have been implicated as the real culprit in certain abuse outcomes. In contrast to individual abusive acts, such as an episode of sexual abuse or a severe beating, these family atmospheres may be better described as a continuous undercurrent that may accompany abuse.<sup>52</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> Celia Williamson and Michael Prior, "Domestic Minor Sex Trafficking: A Network of Underground Players in the Midwest," Journal of Child and Adolescent Trauma 2 (2009): 51.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> Volpe, Talwar and Hunter, Juvenile "Prostitution" in Toronto, 15.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> Farley et al. "Prostitution and Trafficking in Nine Countries," 43.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Valerie J. Edwards, George W. Holden, Vincent J. Felitti, and Robert F. Anda, "Relationship Between Multiple Forms of Childhood Maltreatment and Adult Mental Health in Community Respondents: Results From the Adverse Childhood Experiences Study," The American Journal of Psychiatry 160, no. 8 (2003): 1454.

Neglectful, chaotic and emotional abusive family situations are often caused by a variety of factors, including substance abuse by one or both parents. The interviews that Williamson and Prior conducted with girls involved in prostitution found that 64% "reported that one or both parents were addicted to drugs or alcohol." Other neglectful and chaotic home situations observed in the ACE research included mental illness of a household member, the incarceration of a household member, parental separation, and witnessing the abuse or mistreatment of their female caregivers.

#### 2.5. Homelessness

Homelessness places individuals in situations of incredible vulnerability, and juvenile prostitution thrives in situations of vulnerability and desperation. Of the Canadian respondents involved in prostitution in one study, 86% reported current or past homelessness.<sup>54</sup> Furthermore, 87% of adolescent prostitutes in one study had run away from home.<sup>55</sup> Homeless youth are particularly vulnerable to predators and those who would exploit them, sexually or otherwise.

During their early stages of living on the street, youth are most vulnerable to recruitment by pimps. Research shows that young people from rural and suburban upbringings are more likely to become victims to street life predators. Shelters and drop-ins for homeless youth are often not able to provide services to youth under 16 years of age without notifying child protection agencies. This places youth at increased risk, because if a young person cannot go to a safe place like a drop-in centre or youth shelter without fear of child protective services being called, then they may find themselves in unsafe places where they meet individuals who exploit them. Couch

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> Williamson and Prior, "Domestic Minor Sex Trafficking," 52.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> Farley et al. "Prostitution and Trafficking in Nine Countries," 43.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> Susan M. Nadon, Catherine Koverola, and Eduard H. Schuldermann, "Antecedents to Prostitution: Childhood Victimization," *Journal of Interpersonal Violence* 13, no. 2 (1998): 214.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> Trudee Able-Peterson and June Bucy, *The Street Outreach Training Manual* (Washington: US Department of Health and Human Services, 1993), 9.

surfing or staying on the streets creates additional risks and vulnerabilities, and pimps and predators use these to their advantage.<sup>57</sup> Youth who lack identification, status, or are under 16 are the most vulnerable to sexual exploitation.

Homeless youth who have a history of sexual abuse often continue to be sexually exploited on the street.<sup>58</sup> Sometimes homeless youth engage in survival sex, where sex is traded for food, lodging, clothing, or drugs.<sup>59</sup> Able-Peterson and Bucy highlight homeless youth's vulnerability to sexual exploitation: "They begin to have sex with 'tricks/johns/dates' because others coerce them or to get money for food, lodging, clothing, and the drugs they take to forget the pain they feel."60 The desperation of meeting basic needs faced by homeless youth increases vulnerability and risk.

Homelessness creates a variety of barriers to meaningful employment. The lack of stable housing is a threat to sustaining paid employment within the formal economy. It was observed that, "Homeless young people face the toughest barriers in terms of obtaining and maintaining paid employment and are largely excluded from the formal economy."61 Lack of education and formal training only add to the barriers that already exist for homeless youth. It was observed of the homeless youth involved in the sex trade that, "they were also amongst the most likely to have left school at an early age and to show low levels of work readiness."62 The difficulty obtaining and maintaining paid employment within the formal economy adds to the vulnerability homeless youth face.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> Ibid., 10.; Volpe, Talwar and Hunter, Juvenile "Prostitution" in Toronto, 19.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> Able-Peterson and Bucy, *The Street Outreach Training Manual*, 10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> Gaetz and O'Grady, "Making Money," 434. <sup>62</sup> Gaetz and O'Grady, "Making Money," 450.

## 2.6. School Experiences

A lack of school engagement is correlated with involvement in the sex trade. The sense of belonging a young person feels within the school environment is significant because a positive educational environment offers stability, safety and support when family situations are difficult. Young people are able to build resiliency to other risk factors when they feel a sense of belonging at school and support from the non-parental adults in their lives. 63 Young people who are street-involved tend to lack a strong attachment to school.<sup>64</sup> Runaways reported poor grades, disinterest in school, problems with teachers and trouble relating to adults. <sup>65</sup> The 1985 report of the Minister of Service and Supply observed that it "appears to be very characteristic of juvenile prostitutes that they dropped out of school before completing high school, most usually after grade 10."66 A more recent study observed that 80% of the prostitutes in their sample had left school prematurely. 67 Inadequate school retention for youth involved in the sex trade suggests the need for greater preventative efforts in the education system. Efforts to support school attachment through extra-curricular programming, special education, alternative education, and peer mentoring programs are of the utmost importance to vulnerable and at-risk youth, as these programs are shown to increase school engagement, foster belonging, and nurture resiliency.<sup>68</sup>

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup> Search Institute, "40 Developmental Assets for Adolescents," *Search Institute* (Minneapolis: Search Institute, 1997), http://www.search-institute.org/content/40-developmental-assets-adolescents-ages-12-18 (accessed December 1, 2015); Larry K. Brendtro and Scott J. Larson, *The Resilience Revolution: Discovering Strengths in Challenging Kids*, (Bloomington: Solution Tree Press, 2006), 34; Brendtro, Brokenleg and Van Bockern, *Reclaiming Youth at Risk*, 76, 100.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> Jeff Karabanow, *Being Young and Homeless: Understanding How Youth Enter and Exit Street Life* (New York: Peter Lang Publishing, 2008), 27.

<sup>65</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>66</sup> Special Committee on Pornography and Prostitution (Canada), *Pornography and Prostitution in Canada*, 574.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> Erin Gibbs Van Brunschot and Augustine Brannigan, "Childhood maltreatment and subsequent conduct disorders: The case of female street prostitution," International Journal of Law and Psychiatry 25 (2002): 230.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> Kennedy Arthur Saldanha, "It's better to be bad than stupid": An exploratory study on Resistance and Denial of Special Education Discourses in the Narratives of Street Youth (Toronto: University of Toronto, 2010), 160, 178; Scott Larson and Larry Brendtro, Reclaiming Our Prodigal Sons and Daughters: A Practical Approach for

#### 2.7. Government Institutions

Child protection services can often compound existing stressors in the lives of at-risk and vulnerable young people. Placements within child protection services often lead to a lack of consistency in the lives of young people and to a diminished sense of belonging. <sup>69</sup> Williamson and Prior show that 77% of the girls in the sex trade had been involved with child protection services. 70 This is consistent with the previously mentioned findings of Volpe, Talwar and Hunter, that homeless youth involved in the sex trade had experienced at least one foster home placement.<sup>71</sup> The girls in their study reported that state-run systems, such as juvenile court and social services placed additional demands through their attempts to put them on the right path while doing little to relieve the existing stressors.<sup>72</sup> The girls stated that they felt overwhelmed by the added stressors placed by these institutions and that these stressors contributed to inclinations to give up or run away. 73 The narratives of young women in one study showed that the psychosocial understanding of self impacted by time in care rendered them vulnerable to sexual exploitation.<sup>74</sup> Child protection services and other state-run institutions often compound and complicate risk and create a system in which youth do not feel supported and thus fall through the cracks.

\_

Connecting with Youth in Conflict, (Bloomington: Solution Tree Press, 2000), 46; Brendtro, Brokenleg and Van Bockern, Reclaiming Youth at Risk, 100.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup> Able-Peterson and Bucy, *The Street Outreach Training Manual*, 56; John Seita, "Resiliency from the Other Side of the Desk," *Journal of Emotional and Behavioral Problems* 3, no. 2 (1994): 16; Larson and Brendtro, *Reclaiming Our Prodigal Sons and Daughters*, 25.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> Williamson and Prior, "Domestic Minor Sex Trafficking," 51-52

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>71</sup> Volpe, Talwar and Hunter, *Juvenile "Prostitution" in Toronto*, 15.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>72</sup> Williamson and Prior, "Domestic Minor Sex Trafficking," 53.

<sup>73</sup> Ibid

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>74</sup> Maddy Coy, "Young Women, Local Authority Care and Selling Sex: Findings from Research," *British Journal of Social Work* 38 (2008): 1415, 1421

## 2.8. Problematizing Notions of "Risk"

Risks are the common environmental hazards and external factors that contribute to harmful outcomes. There is a tendency in some of the research and the historical discourse on prostitution to name such factors as internal and personal to the individuals involved.<sup>75</sup> This practice, known as the deficit thinking model blames the victim and implicitly asserts that exploitation is caused by deficits or deficiencies that are personal and internal to the individual, rather than as external and outside of their realm of control.<sup>76</sup>

One example of research that blames women for their own victimization is Gibbs Van Brunschot and Brannigan's research, which compared interviews with female street-level prostitutes to university students in an attempt to understand the correlation between childhood maltreatment and involvement in prostitution. Their comparison of interviews showed many of the risk factors already named, however, their analysis of these findings seemed to blame those involved in prostitution for their own exploitation. For example, they state, "Our results suggest that rather than singular problematic behaviours, the prostitute group is characterized by multiple, co-occurring problem behaviours." This statement would have the reader believe that the individual and their behaviour is the problem, rather than their environment and the experiences of maltreatment that this "prostitute group" has endured. Indeed, even the language of talking about these women as a "prostitute group" seems dehumanizing and degrading of their dignity.

<sup>78</sup> Ibid., 230.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>75</sup> Gibbs Van Brunschot and Brannigan, "Childhood maltreatment and subsequent conduct disorders," 219, 220, 222; Paula Bartley, *Prostitution: Prevention and Reform in England, 1860-1914* (London: Routledge, 2000), 2-5, 30-31, 94-96.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>76</sup> Richard R. Valencia, "Conceptualizing the Notion of Deficit Thinking," in *The Evolution of Deficit Thinking: Educational Thought and Practice*, ed. Richard R. Valencia (Abingdon: Routledge Falmer, 1997), 2.

<sup>77</sup> Gibbs Van Brunschot and Brannigan, "Childhood maltreatment and subsequent conduct disorders," 223.

Gibbs Van Brunschot and Brannigan have a tendency to deficitize<sup>79</sup> women involved in the sex trade, and name their "problem behaviours" as being expelled from school, attempting suicide and running away from home.<sup>80</sup> However, the scholars fail to acknowledge that these behaviours are symptomatic of causative factors and rarely the cause themselves. Being expelled from school, running away, and attempting suicide are cause for concern, but they are not the reason a young person becomes involved in prostitution. They are indications of risk caused by negative home life, parental substance abuse, physical and/or sexual abuse. These factors are not a behavioural problem so much as a desperate cry for help from a youth at-risk.

The age of first sexual experience was another "problem behaviour" addressed by Gibbs Van Brunschot and Brannigan, who referred to this as "sexual precocity." The authors state,

Sexual precocity is the most significant predictor (P. < 05) of prostitution involvement. The regression coefficients suggest that those who are sexually precocious, having sex at age 13 years or younger, were approximately 4.4 times as likely to be involved in prostitution as those having their first sexual experience after age 13. None of the other indicators of maltreatment, such as nontraditional family structure, parental use of drugs and alcohol, physical abuse, and sexual abuse, was significant. 82

Precocity itself is a charged term that implies a passing of judgment and placing of blame on the girls involved. It is important to bear in mind that the law states that sexual experiences for those under the age of 13 is deemed non-consensual. Even more striking, Gibbs Van Brunschot and Brannigan found that the younger the age of first sexual experience, the greater the age difference between the respondent and her first consensual sexual partner. <sup>83</sup> Given that these sexual experiences occurred under the age of 13 and also given the age discrepancy between the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>79</sup> The use of deficitize as a verb means to employ the deficit thinking model. The use of deficitize as a verb in this way can be seen in: Rob Simon, "'Starting with What Is': Exploring Response and Responsibility to Student Writing through Collaborative Inquiry." *English Education* 45, no. 2 (2013): 141.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>80</sup> Gibbs Van Brunschot and Brannigan, "Childhood maltreatment and subsequent conduct disorders," 221-222.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>81</sup> Ibid., 227.

<sup>82</sup> Ibid.

<sup>83</sup> Ibid., 229.

persons involved, it seems what has occurred is in fact statutory rape. Statutory rape cannot be consented to and should not be labelled sexual precocity.

The language used when discussing the sex trade and the women involved matters; deficitizing language is laden with judgements and assumptions. This language contributes to a shame narrative which blames girls and women for their own abuse and exploitation. Deficitizing points to exploited people as the problem rather than the social systems and structures that contributed to that exploitation, and becomes complacent to exploitation.

## 3. Prostitution in Canada Today

There are a variety of commonly held myths about prostitution and sex trafficking. Faulty assumptions are frequently made about how and why prostitution occurs and its harms. Farley et al. address common misunderstandings about prostitution:

Our findings contradict common myths about prostitution: the assumption that street prostitution is the worst type of prostitution, that prostitution of men and boys is different from prostitution of women and girls, that most of those in prostitution freely consent to it, that most people are in prostitution because of drug addiction, that prostitution is qualitatively different from trafficking, and that legalizing or decriminalizing prostitution would decrease harm <sup>84</sup>

Challenging these false assumptions requires understanding the ways young people come to be involved in prostitution and the roles of pimps and purchasers. It also involves evaluating the meanings of choice and consent. In order to truly evaluate the impact of prostitution, we must examine the risks posed to the health and wellbeing of those involved and discuss these risks in ways that do not deficitize or blame the individuals who have been harmed.

In this section, I examine what prostitution in Canada looks like today and show that juvenile prostitution in Canada is not one consistent, specific and uniform reality. I show that the

 $<sup>^{84}</sup>$  Farley et al. "Prostitution and Trafficking in Nine Countries," 34.

commercial sex industry is comprised of a series of sub-trades, including brothels, massage parlours, escort services, strip clubs, and street prostitution. I also show that the sex trade poses considerable harm to those involved, including gynaecological concerns, violence, and substance addiction. Young people involved in the sex trade are often recruited, coerced, and procured by pimps who may use threats of violence and/or emotional manipulation to maintain control. Comparing and contrasting these realities paints a fuller picture of global child sex trafficking and the harm posed to children.

#### 3.1. Sub-trades in the Industry

The sex trade in Canada includes a variety of sub-trades. Prostitution is not only what occurs at street-level, but also incorporates several sub-trades that include varied arrangements, types of exploitation, and sub-cultures. Farley et al. define the commercial sex industry as follows:

Commercial sex businesses include street prostitution, massage brothels, escort services, outcall services, strip clubs, lap dancing, phone sex, adult and child pornography (including the sexual assault of children by organized groups of pedophiles as well as non-pedophile rapists), child prostitution, video and Internet pornography, trafficking, and prostitution tourism. 85

The commercial sex industry is multi-faceted; prostitution exists within the culture of a global industry built on the sexual exploitation of others. Saldanha and Parenteau aptly describe these sub-cultures, as "sub-trades". The sub-trades are interrelated and an individual may be involved in more than one. <sup>86</sup>

Street prostitution is divided into various sub-trades including "high track" street prostitution, "low track" street prostitution, transgender prostitution, male prostitution, and child prostitution.

<sup>85</sup> Ihid

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>86</sup> Kennedy Saldanha and Derek Parenteau, "'Well, if you can't smile you should go home!' Experiences and reflective insights on providing outreach to young sex workers," *Children and Youth Services Review* 35 (2013): 1277.

Saldanha and Parenteau define and describe the difference between high track and low track street prostitution:

'High track' refers to a geographical area where sex trade workers solicit on the actual streets and have a cost ranging between \$150 and \$1000 per service. In terms of those who work outside, those on 'high track' make the most money and are also the most likely to be controlled by organized crime... [whereas] 'low track' is an area where the sex trade workers are engaging in prostitution for a very low cost, mostly in response to an addiction and/or homelessness.<sup>87</sup>

High track sex trade workers have different motivations, concerns and needs than low track sex trade workers. The needs of someone who is leaving a trafficker in order to exit the sex trade requires different support than a response to homelessness and substance use. The commercial sex industry within Canada is multi-faceted, layered, and complex; an effective response must understand this complexity.

Sex trade sub-trades have geographical bounds, and high track street prostitution has different geographical bounds than low track street prostitution. 88 The geographical bounds may involve the difference of a neighbourhood, a few blocks or the other side of the street. 99 In Toronto, massage parlors tend to be more densely concentrated in areas of wealth like the financial district and major tourist areas. 90 Geography is constantly changing, and community revitalization, gentrification, development projects, and street closures all impact the geography of the sex trade. Saldanha and Parenteau observed, "The geographic bounds of the sex trade in Toronto are in constant flux. Factors such as gang conflict, police response, gentrification, and political climate contribute to a quickly changing environment." Geography plays a significant role in

88 Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>87</sup> Ibid.

<sup>89</sup> Ibid.

<sup>90</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>91</sup> Ibid.

the commercial sex industry and how it operates on the local level. The police response, political climate, weather, and particular community events all impact how the sex trade operates.

#### 3.2. Harm & health concerns

Sex with multiple different people every day poses inherent risk and possible harm to an individual's health. This harm increases when coupled with violence and coercion. Gaetz and O'Grady observed that homeless youth involved in the sex trade experienced the greatest levels of health decline while on the streets. 92 Health concerns are multifaceted and may affect physical, mental, emotional and spiritual health. Rabinovitch states,

People in prostitution commonly feel isolated, alienated, suicidal, are alcohol or drug dependent, have eating disorders, self-mutilate, have difficulty concentrating, have gynecological problems, and sexual dysfunction. Many addicted prostitutes were not involved in substance abuse before entering prostitution. 93

Gynecological issues, violence, substance abuse, and psycho-spiritual concerns pose grave and serious health risks to both juveniles and adults involved in prostitution.

Gynecological diseases and cancers impact women involved in prostitution at higher rates than other women.<sup>94</sup> Women involved in prostitution are at increased risk for pelvic inflammatory disease, sexually transmitted infections and for developing cervical cancer, connected with their young age of first sexual activity and their overall number of sexual partners. 95 Melissa Farley observes, "Cervical cancer is common among women who have been in prostitution." 96

Treatment for cervical cancer can involve the removal and loss of several organs including: the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>92</sup> Gaetz and O'Grady, "Making Money," 447.<sup>93</sup> Rabinovitch, "PEERS," 240.

<sup>94</sup> Susanne Krüger Kjaer, Edith I. Svare, Anne Marie Worm, Jan M. M. Walboomers, Chris J. L. M. Meijer, and Adriaan J. C. Van Den Brule, "Human Papillomavirus Infection in Danish Female Sex Workers: Decreasing Prevalence with Age Despite Continuously High Sexual Activity," Sexually Transmitted Diseases 27, no. 8 (2000):

<sup>95</sup> Melissa Farley, "Bad for the Body, Bad for the Heart': Prostitution Harms Women Even if Legalized on Decriminalized." Violence Against Women 10, no. 10 (2004): 1097. 96 Ibid.

cervix, the uterus, the bladder, and parts of the bowel. The travail of women's cancers and the spiritual and theological needs that follow are explored by Dean and Cullen:

As with breast cancer, many factors alter a woman's ability to cope; perhaps the major factor is how the woman perceives the organ(s) involved. If she views the organ as major to her sense of self as a woman, then loss of the organ can often put her in a crisis.<sup>97</sup>

Dean and Cullen aptly note that when a woman has been conditioned through her experience in the sex trade to equate her very worth with these organs, their loss can be experienced deeply. <sup>98</sup> For many others, experiences of violence and abuse may have led them to feel these organs were taken from them long before they were diagnosed with cancer.

Physical and sexual violence are a dominant reality for those involved in prostitution. The most common forms of violence experienced by trafficked youth were robbery, rape, and physical assaults. 99 Research with Canadian respondents found that while in prostitution 91% had been physically assaulted and 67% were threatened with a weapon. 100 This same research also found that 76% of Canadian respondents had been raped while in prostitution and of those 67% were raped more than five times. 101 Of the 47 women from the Prairie Provinces who had been involved in prostitution as adolescents, only 3 reported having never had a bad date; most described numerous violent acts perpetrated towards them. 102 The World Health Organization states:

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>97</sup> Mary James Dean and Mary Louise Cullen, "Woman's Body: Spiritual need and theological presence," in *Women in Travail and Transition: A New Pastoral Care*, ed. Maxine Glaz and Jeanne Stevenson Moessner (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1991), 101.

<sup>98</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>99</sup> Williamson and Prior, "Domestic Minor Sex Trafficking," 56.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>100</sup> Farley et al. "Prostitution and Trafficking in Nine Countries," 43.

<sup>101</sup> Ibid

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>102</sup> Nixon et al. "The Everyday Occurrence," 1027.

Violence is a manifestation of the stigma and discrimination experienced by sex workers. In all societies, sex work is highly stigmatized and sex workers are often subjected to blame, labelling, disapproval and discriminatory treatment. 103

The complacency towards this violence further contributes to the harm caused and creates a barrier preventing sex workers from accessing the support they need.

The case of British Columbia pig farmer, Robert William Pickton is an example of the dangers faced by Canadian women involved in the sex trade. Bone fragments, blood, personal belongings and DNA for 32 women were found on the Pickton farm. 104 Victims were involved in the sex trade in Vancouver's Downtown Eastside. Evidence suggests that at his farm, Pickton raped and murdered his victims and fed their butchered bodies to his pigs or tossed them in the furnace. 105 Despite having pled not guilty, Robert Pickton confessed to his cell-mate to have been responsible for the deaths of 49 women. <sup>106</sup> In 2009, a jury found Robert Pickton guilty of second-degree murder for six women. 107 The complacency of law enforcement further contributed to violent deaths of Pickton's victims. The Vancouver Police Department had reports of missing women from the Downtown Eastside and Coquitlam RCMP knew that Robert Pickton was a suspect but failed to watch him carefully. 108 The complacency of law enforcement and the stigmatization of sex trade involved women leads to an environment in which women fear reporting to the police and thus perpetuates the continuation of such violence.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>103</sup> World Health Organization, "Violence against sex workers and HIV Prevention." Violence Against Women and HIV/AIDS: Critical Intersections 3 (2005): 1. http://www.who.int/gender/documents/sexworkers.pdf (accessed November 30, 2015).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>104</sup> Stevie Cameron, On the Farm: Robert William Pickton and the Tragic Story of Vancouver's Missing Women (Toronto: Vintage Canada, 2011), 701. <sup>105</sup> Ibid., 571-572.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>106</sup> Ibid., 526.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>107</sup> Ibid., 692.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>108</sup> Ibid., 702.

The correlation between substance use and the sex trade is of particular prevalence in Canada. When comparing the sex trade in 9 countries, Farley et al. found that 95% of Canadian sex trade involved respondents used drugs, compared to the 48% average of the nine countries. <sup>109</sup> Though substance use is often part of street-life, it was observed that 29% of the street-involved youth who relied on the sex trade as their primary way of making money indicated that they used cocaine and/or heroin daily, which is significantly higher than the average of 7%. <sup>110</sup> In order to qualitatively contextualize this data, one young woman named Monica, who was interviewed by Gaetz and O'Grady, spoke of the relationship between prostitution and substance use in her life as follows:

(Prostitution is) incredibly degrading - I became a serious alcoholic and drug addict because of it. Because it was so degrading it was my only way of dealing with it and that's why I don't do it anymore, both jobs stripping and escorting. I was always incredibly high or incredibly drunk or both and ended up in detox.<sup>111</sup>

Monica's statement speaks to the ways addiction and the sex trade become interwoven. Please note that drug use and addiction can be used by pimps for recruitment and maintenance of control. The use of substances and sex trade involvement is often interrelated.

## 3.3. The Role of Pimps

Pimps facilitate the recruitment and procuring of persons into the sex trade. The discourse and language around sex trafficking has changed over time. Human trafficking previously implied the transportation of individuals for the purpose of exploitation across international borders. Sex trafficking is now understood to be the control, coercion, and manipulation through which an

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>109</sup> Farley et al. "Prostitution and Trafficking in Nine Countries," 50.

<sup>110</sup> Gaetz and O'Grady, "Making Money," 446.
111 Gaetz and O'Grady, "Making Money," 447.

individual is sexually exploited regardless of what transportation occurs. <sup>112</sup> Pimps and traffickers are now understood as the same and the terms are currently used interchangeably. <sup>113</sup>

Pimps take different tactics in recruiting sex workers. These tactics may be differentiated as either finesse pimps or guerilla pimps. However, both methods involve facilitating, controlling and profiting off the sexual exploitation of another person. Williamson and Prior describe finesse pimping in the following way:

Finesse pimping involves manipulating young girls into situations where they seemingly make their own decisions to enter, sell sexual services, and give their money to a trafficker. Several finessing techniques were described, from putting vulnerable girls into situations in which they feel obligated to pay back kindness shown to them, using bait and switch techniques that serve to exploit the dreams of victims, and utilizing victims' attempts to provide for their own basic needs. 114

The finesse pimp relies on relationship, and this type of pimp fulfills the role of a boyfriend, husband, or father-figure. Given the nature of the relationship, it is sometimes the case that a young person does not recognize the exploitive nature of the relationship. Guerilla pimping involves a different approach than finesse pimping. Williamson and Prior describe guerilla pimping as "recruitment by force in which a trafficker approaches and forces his victim to work for him through the use of threat, physical violence, and intimidation." In contrast to finesse pimps, guerilla pimps rely on force and fear. Though Williamson and Prior use male pronouns to describe pimps, there are females involved in both finesse and guerilla pimping. The recruitment, control techniques, and extent of transportation are often dependent upon the type of pimp.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>112</sup> MCIS Language Services, *Helping Trafficked Persons: Resource Handbook for Service Providers* (Toronto: MCIS Language Services, 2014), 2-3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>113</sup> Ibid., 6, 8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>114</sup> Williamson and Prior, "Domestic Minor Sex Trafficking," 50.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>115</sup> Ibid., 51.

<sup>116</sup> Ibid.

Pimps recruit from a variety of locations and use varied techniques that depend on the type of pimp. Finesse pimping relies most heavily on relationship and thus is aided when there is a pre-existing relationship. The pimp may be a friend, boyfriend, or authority figure.<sup>117</sup> Girls are recruited from a variety of locations:

Respondents reported that recruitment into the child sex trade took place on the streets, while walking to a friend's house or hanging out with a group of friends, at corner stores, malls, and hang-out houses, outside of the juvenile justice centre while waiting to meet with a probation officer, and at their own homes. They were approached by girls, women, young men, and older men. Most commonly youth were approached by someone who knew them, someone who knew of them through other friends, or someone they vaguely knew from around the neighbourhood. 118

Pimps frequently target children and youth who lack emotional support. Recruitment that takes place outside juvenile justice centres or while waiting to meet with their probation officers is indicative the level of profiling, and targeting of at-risk youth that occurs. Pimps recruit and entice through five main factors: love, debt, addiction, physical threat, and authority. These factors are often combined, or a pimp may use different recruitment techniques with different girls. The ways love and belonging are manipulated by pimps in the recruitment of girls suggests that this most basic need is absent to the point that they are willing to accept the destructive and distorted versions being offered and gestures to the preventative measures needed.

Pimps maintain control through a variety of means and methods. The most powerful method seems to be the emotional control that they wield through manipulation, false promises, or threats of violence. Kennedy et al. explain,

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>117</sup> M. Alexis Kennedy, Carolin Klein, Jessica T.K. Bristowe, Barry S. Cooper, and John C. Yuille. "Routes of Recruitment: Pimps' Techniques and Other Circumstances That Lead to Street Prostitution," *Journal of Aggression, Maltreatment & Trauma* 15, no. 2 (2007): 6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>118</sup> Williamson and Prior, "Domestic Minor Sex Trafficking," 49-50.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>119</sup> Volpe, Talwar and Hunter, Juvenile "Prostitution" in Toronto, 20.

<sup>120</sup> Kennedy et al., "Routes of Recruitment," 4.

<sup>121</sup> Ibid.

The combination of having their hearts broken, the shame of having been prostituted, and the fear of the pimp kept young women on the streets and afraid to ask for help. The women were left emotionally shattered, ashamed, disoriented, and afraid. 122

When pimps are able to recruit and control with love, attention, and promises of a perfect life, it is not easy for women to give up on the hope of "happily-ever-after." Prostituted women report difficulty giving up the fantasy that the pimps promised and believing that their time on the streets was only a detour before their perfect life would begin. <sup>123</sup> Emotional manipulation is one of a number of methods a pimp may use, and the same pimp may use different methods of control with different women.

Women who are most controlled by pimps tend to be those who are in demand by buyers and who can solicit the highest prices. Saldanha and Parenteau explain,

[T]hose who are under age, have the highest prices and are most controlled because of the large demand by johns (buyers) for what is perceived as taboo - ethnicities considered exotic, (under)age, role playing, etc. In Toronto, the average sex trade worker entered the trade after being procured by a pimp in their early teens. After years of exploitation and few opportunities for change, even if they are no longer exploited by a pimp, many of these young people feel as though they have no option but to go on to work independently in the sex trade. 124

Women in the sex trade often feel that few opportunities or options exist, and this feeling may be traced back to having left school prematurely, struggles with addiction, and poverty. A pimp will often use drugs to maintain control. 125 Pimps will make those they are controlling feel as though there are no other options. There is a tendency by pimps to move their workers around as a way of increasing profits and decreasing police attention. <sup>126</sup> This movement also creates a disorientation that decreases the likelihood that a girl they are controlling would feel safe or

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>122</sup> Ibid., 7.

<sup>124</sup> Saldanha and Parenteau, "'Well, if you can't smile you should go home!'" 1277. Able-Peterson and Bucy, *The Street Outreach Training Manual*, 70.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>126</sup> Saldanha and Parenteau, "Well, if you can't smile you should go home!" 1277.

empowered to runaway. Leaving a pimp is a dangerous act, and those who have attempted to do so often face increased violence and extreme persistence in pursuit by pimps. <sup>127</sup> Control is maintained through manipulating emotions, creating drug dependency, limiting options, disorientation, threats, and violence.

#### 3.4. Johns

Individuals who solicit or buy sexual services are commonly referred to as "johns." Purchasers are also sometimes referred to as "dates" or "clients," and these terms are particularly misleading when dealing with juvenile prostitution. The term "dates" implies consent and mutual benefit, while "clients" implies a business relationship; neither is the case in the commercial sexual exploitation of juveniles. Purchasers are also referred to as "tricks," on the streets but this language does not commonly appear in academic discourse. The use of the term "john," conveys the truth that most purchasers are male, even as the term seeks to normalize their activity. The literature and academic research on prostitution has focused primarily on the backgrounds and experiences of sex workers. There has been a recent shift in research as the complacent "boys will be boys" attitude toward "johns," has begun to be challenged both in the laws and in scholarly discourse. 128

Awareness campaigns and debates on prostitution laws have begun to challenge the complacent "boys will be boys" complicity in the sex trade. This attitude involves an assumption that men need the sex trade in order to have their physical needs met and to release aggression. This complacent acceptance of the sex trade has been significantly highlighted and critiqued by recent campaigns drawing awareness to rape culture. For example, the "Real Men Don't Buy Girls"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>127</sup> Able-Peterson and Bucy, *The Street Outreach Training Manual*, 70.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>128</sup> Melissa Farley, Jan MacLeod, Lynn Anderson and Jacqueline M. Golding, "Attitudes and Social Characteristics of Men Who Buy Sex in Scotland," Psychological Trauma: Theory, Research, Practice and Policy 3, no. 4 (2011): 369-383; Victor Malarek, *The Johns: Sex for Sale and the Men Who Buy It* (New York: Arcade Publishing, 2011).

campaign on social media has featured popular male celebrities such as Ashton Kutcher, Justin Timberlake, and Sean Penn. These men and others have used social media<sup>129</sup> to bring attention to the matter, by posting videos and pictures of themselves with the message, "Real Men Don't Buy Girls."<sup>130</sup> The effectiveness of such a campaign in curbing the demand is difficult to measure, but does garner attention and raise awareness.<sup>131</sup>

Economies are driven by supply and demand and the economy of the sex trade is no different.

Saldanha and Parenteau explain how demand impacts sex trade and the perpetuation of juvenile prostitution:

The demand is driven by the buyers or "johns" from all cultural and socio-economic groups. The high demand for sex trade workers tends in turn to place demands on individuals (pimps or human traffickers) who will groom, control, and market those sex workers who appeal most to the johns. <sup>132</sup>

Ending juvenile prostitution also requires seeking to end demand. Arresting pimps and traffickers, and providing preventative programs to girls is not sufficient if the demand is not also being addressed.

Buyers typically hold attitudes that reinforce deep gender inequality. Such attitudes are often reinforced by popular culture through television, film, music and video games.<sup>133</sup> The sex trade is supported by falsehood, a series of lies that deny and minimize the victimization, and make the sex trade more desirable to the "johns." For example, one recent study sought to understand the

<sup>130</sup>Lucas Kavner, "Ashton Kutcher and Demi Moore Launch 'Real Men Don't Buy Girls' Campaign (VIDEO)," *HuffPost Impact* (April 11, 2011), http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2011/04/11/ashton-kutcher-demi-moore-trafficking n 847291.html (accessed July 17, 2015).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>129</sup> THORN - Digital Defenders of Children, "Thorn's Channel," *YouTube*, https://www.youtube.com/user/DNAFoundation (accessed July 17, 2015).

Cordelia Hebblethwaite, "#BBCTrending: #RealMenDontBuyGirls and the #BringBackOurGirls campaign," *BBC Trending*, (May 8, 2014), http://www.bbc.com/news/blogs-trending-27328414 (accessed July 17, 2015). Saldanha and Parenteau, "Well, if you can't smile you should go home!," 1277.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>133</sup> Tichakunda Tsedu, "Hip hop music perpetuates stereotypes," *Gender and Media Diversity Journal: Gender, Popular Culture and Media Freedom* 10 (2012): 23.

attitudes and opinions of the johns, and to what degree they were aware of and complacent to the oppression and coercion that exists in prostitution:

Approximately one-fourth of our interviewees (28%) reported that they had used a woman in prostitution who they knew was under control of a pimp. Of the study participants, 42% said that they had observed a prostituted woman who had a pimp, and 20% had talked to a pimp or had friends who had done so. Half of the buyers we interviewed tended not to acknowledge the extent of the violent coercion that exists in prostitution. Half of them (50%) stated that prostitutes are victimized by pimps, whereas the other half disagreed with that statement. 134

Acknowledging the violence, coercion, and exploitation that exists in prostitution challenges the "happy hooker" myth perpetuated by films such as "The Best Little Whorehouse in Texas." Myths about prostitution excuse, deny, and perpetuate abuse and violence committed by "johns." The aforementioned study explored these myths and found that 10% of the men in their sample "asserted that the concept of rape does not apply to women in prostitution." These myths perpetuate not only the sex trade itself, but also the violence, abuse, exploitation, and victimization that prostituted individuals' experience. Understanding and exposing the attitudes, assumptions, and myths underlying prostitution is essential and necessary for advocacy, prevention, and change.

#### 3.5. An International View of Prostitution

When many North Americans hear "child prostitution," there is a tendency to think of the global south or developing countries. Global awareness campaigns on human trafficking and Canadian Christian organizations working to end human trafficking tend to focus their attention and efforts outside our borders. For example, Ratanak International works to end the sexual exploitation of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>134</sup> Farley et al., "Attitudes and Social Characteristics of Men Who Buy Sex in Scotland," 372-373.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>135</sup> Larry L. King, Peter Masterton, and Colin Higgins, *The Best Little Whorehouse in Texas*, DVD, Directed by Colin Higgins (Willowdale: Universal Studios, 1982).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>136</sup> Farley et al., "Attitudes and Social Characteristics of Men Who Buy Sex in Scotland," 374.

children in Cambodia,<sup>137</sup> and International Justice Mission "works in nearly 20 communities throughout Africa, Latin America, South and Southeast Asia." These organizations, along with World Vision and many others work to raise awareness of child trafficking, rescue children, and seek to end juvenile prostitution in the developing countries, but draw little attention to the issues in the developed countries they call home. Practical theologian Pamela Couture writes about the concerns facing children in both the developed and developing contexts and the continuity of the issues:

Although the numbers of children on, of, and in the street in the United States may be less than the proportion of children in the southern hemisphere, significant continuities exist: street children are likely to be trying to escape stress, abuse, neglect, violence, and dysfunction in families or communities, but are vulnerable to an intractably exploitive world of systematized economic and sexual exploitation, drug trafficking and abuse, and prostitution. <sup>139</sup>

Children in the developing world face a variety of risks, but similarities exist between their risks and those faced by children in the Canadian context. The sexual exploitation of children is not a reality that exists only within the developing world.

Christopher Bagley conducted research in Canada and the Philippines comparing the realities of juvenile prostitution in these two countries and various experiential realities. <sup>140</sup> In comparing adolescent prostitution in Canada and the Philippines, he determined that while there was little difference within his sample group regarding the mean age of becoming a prostitute, 15.4 in Canada and 15.2 in the Philippines, there were in fact significant differences in the level of abuse and exploitation each faced prior to and during their involvement in the sex trade. <sup>141</sup> His findings

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>137</sup> Ratanak International, "Anti-Exploitation Programs," *Ratanak International: Renew Hope. Restore Cambodia.*, http://ratanak.org/projects/exploitation/ (accessed July 17, 2015).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>138</sup> International Justice Mission, "Where We Work," *IJM*, https://www.ijm.org/where-we-work (accessed July 17, 2015)

<sup>139</sup> Couture, Seeing Children, Seeing God, 32.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>140</sup> Bagley, "Adolescent prostitution in Canada and the Philippines," 451.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>141</sup> Ibid., 448.

show that nearly 40% more of the Canadians experienced physical and sexual abuse (73.3% compared to 34.6%), the Canadians mean age of first intercourse was 3 years younger (11.4 compared to 14.8 for Filipinos), and the Canadians experienced significantly more sexual abuse prior to entering prostitution. This research also examined the amount of exploitation experienced each week by seeking to compare the number of clients each group served in a week. Bagley observed that the average number of clients per week when working full time in prostitution was significantly different. Bagley stated,

The most startling difference was the number of clients the two national groups had to serve in an average week. The Canadian group (which was older than the Filipino group when interviewed, and had already left prostitution) had when working served an average of about 56 clients a week, compared with the nine clients a week serviced by Filipino girls. <sup>143</sup>

This is not to minimize the harm caused to children abused through commercial sexual exploitation in the Philippines or anywhere else in the world. However, children and youth within Canada continue to be abused and sexually exploited. Child sexual exploitation is a global issue requiring an urgent response.

# 4. Canada's legal context

The Canadian laws surrounding prostitution have been in flux over the past several years. The Supreme Court of Canada struck down the national prostitution laws on December 20, 2013, in the case of Bedford et al. v. The Attorney General of Canada, on the grounds that these laws violated the liberty and security interests of Canadian sex workers. <sup>144</sup> The Supreme Court of Canada placed a suspension on the invalidity of the previous laws for a year. This suspension gave the federal government up to a year to create new laws and limitations. At the time, many

<sup>142</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>143</sup> Ibid., 451.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>144</sup> Lauren Sampson, "'The Obscenities of this Country': Canada v. Bedford and the Reform of Canadian Prostitution Laws," *Duke Journal of Gender Law and Policy* 22, no. 137 (2014): 142.

people speculated potential legalization of prostitution in Canada. Though the Government of Canada has put out new laws in Bill C-36, both the criticism it has received and changes in political leadership suggest that the legal landscape may continue to shift, adapt, and change.

The implication of the law change is not well understood in the Church or in broader society, and the risk and vulnerability that legalization would pose to children and youth in Canada has not been thoroughly addressed. Legalization has been promoted on the claim that by so doing it will decrease sex trafficking. Volpe, Talwar and Hunter, observed:

[C]ountries with legalized prostitution have 3 to 10 times as many non-registered women prostitutes as registered prostitutes. Many non-registered women are victims of sex trafficking. Child "prostitution" has not been reduced in these countries. In many instances, it has increased. 145

Legalization will not end sex trafficking and the sexual exploitation of young people in Canada. <sup>146</sup> The questions about Canada's prostitution laws and the protection of young people have been a growing discussion over the past 30 years. The Canadian context is not the only one grappling with questions surrounding legalization. Through observing the laws of other countries and their outcomes, the implications of legal changes in Canada can be better understood.

The Canadian context of the 1980s saw the release of major reports from the Canadian Association of Elizabeth Fry Societies, <sup>147</sup> The Minister of Supply and Services Canada, <sup>148</sup> and the Canadian Child Welfare Association. <sup>149</sup> All three reports addressed the problem of juvenile prostitution in Canada, called for an urgent response, and suggested a shift in the way society was coming to understand prostitution. The case of Bedford et al. v. The Attorney General of

<sup>147</sup> Canadian Association of Elizabeth Fry Societies, *Juvenile Prostitution: A Look at Badgley and Fraser* (Ottawa: Canadian Association of Elizabeth Fry Societies, 1985).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>145</sup> Volpe, Talwar and Hunter, *Juvenile "Prostitution" in Toronto*, 11.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>146</sup> Ibid., 12.

Special Committee on Pornography and Prostitution (Canada), Pornography and Prostitution in Canada.
 National Consultation on Adolescent Prostitution, Proceedings of the National Consultation on Adolescent Prostitution (Ottawa: Canadian Child Welfare Association, 1987).

Canada challenged the prostitution laws as unconstitutional.<sup>150</sup> The case and the Supreme Court of Canada's ruling called for a new understanding of the prostitution laws in Canada.

Legalization and the Nordic Model have both been part of the conversation as the laws have been reimagined, reinterpreted, and re-written. The introduction on June 4, 2014 of the Protection of

Communities and Exploited Person Act (Bill C-36) is the result of such imagining and an

attempt to address issues surrounding prostitution in Canada.

### 4.1. The Canadian context of the 1980s

The Canadian context and conversations of the 1980s show the beginning of a paradigm shift in the justice system's understanding and treatment of prostitution. The protection of children and youth involved in prostitution and a change in the laws to more thoroughly support exploited children was the resounding call of the reports of 1980s. The 1985 report of the Canadian Association of Elizabeth Fry Societies discussed how approaches of punishing, isolating and/or saving prostitutes were unsuccessful and only allowed Canadian society to avoid addressing the serious issues surrounding the sex trade. These problems included, "the sexual exploitation of women and children, the pimping of others with seeming impunity, and the status of women and children in Canadian society." This report called for a shift in perspective and a change in our laws, a shift that would see increased penalties for pimping and that would elevate the status of women and children. At the time, juvenile prostitution was seen as a serious problem in Canada

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>150</sup> Supreme Court of Canada, "Attorney General of Canada, et al. v. Terri Jean Bedford, et al.," *Summary* (December 3, 2012), http://www.scc-csc.gc.ca/case-dossier/info/sum-som-eng.aspx?cas=34788 (accessed July 8, 2015).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>151</sup> Canadian Association of Elizabeth Fry Societies, *Juvenile Prostitution*, 3.

<sup>152</sup> Ibid.

requiring an immediate response from all sectors of government.<sup>153</sup> Juvenile prostitution was beginning to be understood as the sexual exploitation of children and youth.

In the 1980s, the Canadian government was aware that juvenile prostitution was a problem that needed to be addressed. The Report of the Minister of Supply and Services recommended changes to the Criminal Code of Canada with respect to the behaviour and protection of young people. This report calls for criminalizing the procuring of children and prohibiting engaging in paid sexual activity with young people, and no longer penalizing the young people involved in these activities. The report strongly asserts that children and youth are not responsible for their own sexual exploitation through juvenile prostitution. Those who are responsible for the sexual exploitation of these children need to be held responsible, namely the pimps and purchasers. Children and youth involved in juvenile prostitution were no longer viewed as criminals, but rather as children in need of protection.

Juvenile prostitution began to be seen and understood as the sexual abuse of children in the 1980s. Juvenile prostitution in Canada was beginning to be understood as a problem that Canada must own and respond to; acting otherwise implied condoning the sexual abuse of children. The Canadian Child Welfare Association made legal and legislative recommendations along these lines through their National Consultation on Juvenile Prostitution. They recommended decriminalizing juvenile prostitution and responding with a child welfare response, providing

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>153</sup> National Consultation on Adolescent Prostitution, *Proceedings of the National Consultation on Adolescent Prostitution*, 1.

Special Committee on Pornography and Prostitution (Canada), Pornography and Prostitution in Canada, 28.Ibid

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>156</sup> National Consultation on Adolescent Prostitution, *Proceedings of the National Consultation on Adolescent Prostitution*, 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>157</sup> Ibid., 7.

support to the youth and ensuring such supports were consistent throughout Canada.<sup>158</sup> They also recommended severe penalties for customers of juveniles involved in prostitution.<sup>159</sup> A paradigm shift surrounding juvenile prostitution was occurring as distinctions were being made between young people and adults in prostitution.

### 4.2. Bedford et al vs. Attorney General of Canada

The prostitution laws in Canada remained relatively unchallenged and unchanged, despite the problems suggested in reports. In 2007, three women who were or had been involved in the sex trade challenged the prostitution laws. Terri Jean Bedford, Amy Lebovitch and Valerie Scott forced the Attorney General, Government of Canada, and the society as a whole to reconsider the laws. The challenge began with the Ontario Court of Appeal and made its way to the Supreme Court of Canada. Bedford et al. challenged the constitutional validity of the prostitution laws pertaining to keeping a common bawdy house, living off the avails of prostitution and communicating for the purposes of prostitution. Jeo Justice Himel of the Ontario Superior Court of Justice found that the laws deprived sex workers of their liberty and security of person through potential imprisonment or increasing the risk of injury. The Supreme Court of Canada heard oral arguments on June 12, 2013 from both sides on the prostitution laws, on their constitutional validity, and the safety of individuals involved in the sex trade. Former and current sex trade workers came out on both sides of the debate. The polarization between abolitionist groups and

<sup>158</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>159</sup> Ihid

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>160</sup> Supreme Court of Canada, "Attorney General of Canada, et al. v. Terri Jean Bedford, et al.,"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>161</sup> Sampson, "The Obscenities in this Country," 141.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>162</sup> Ibid., 142.

the pro-legalization lobby grew and clashed at several hearings. <sup>163</sup> Each group shared experiences, expressing that this was a complicated and complex issue.

The Supreme Court of Canada reviewed the findings of the Ontario Court of Appeal; they heard testimony from legal experts, academics, former and current sex trade workers, and various interest groups. After a full day of hearing arguments and testimony on June 12, 2013, the Supreme Court of Canada decided to reserve its decision. On December 20, 2013 the Supreme Court of Canada concluded that the challenged laws violated constitutional rights, but that did not preclude Parliament from setting limits. Furthermore the Supreme Court stated, "Considering all the interests at stake, the declaration of invalidity should be suspended for one year." The ruling was viewed by many as the dawn of the legalization of prostitution in Canada. Though Parliament was given a year to introduce new laws, if the Supreme Court proceedings were any indication, reaching consensus on what these laws should be would not be easy. The case frequently made front-page news, and Canadians could no longer turn a blind-eye to prostitution, but rather were forced to think critically about constitutional rights, security of person, and what legalization might mean for their country.

# 4.3. A Move toward Legalization

When the prostitution laws were challenged, Bedford et al. hoped for the legalization of prostitution in Canada. Through legalization it was thought that sex work would be legitimized and harms would be eliminated. The hope was that legalization would eliminate the

166 Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>163</sup> Jayme Poisson, "Sex worker advocates clash over landmark ruling, *Toronto Star*, (March 26, 2012), http://www.thestar.com/news/gta/2012/03/26/sex\_worker\_advocates\_clash\_over\_landmark\_ruling.html (accessed July 8, 2015).

Toronto Star (June 13, 2013), http://www.thestar.com/news/canada/2013/06/13/supreme\_court\_prostitution\_case\_judges\_challenge\_government\_to\_justify\_brothel\_ban.html\_(accessed July 8, 2015).

165 Canada (Attorney General) v. Bedford, 2013 SCC 72, 3 S.C.R. 1101, (SCC 2013), 1107.

discrimination, stigma, and isolation that those involved in the sex trade face and thereby eliminate the harm. The hope is that such legitimization would mean the elimination of organized crime groups involved in the sex trade and a decrease in the trafficking of women and children. However, a change in the law does not necessarily mean a change in public attitude and opinion. In order to understand the correlation between ideals and outcomes in relation to prostitution laws, it is necessary to examine outcomes from countries that have legalized prostitution.

In Australia, the Netherlands and Germany, prostitution was legalized with the aforementioned expected outcomes. However, the results have been quite the opposite, as countries with legalized prostitution have 3 to 10 times as many non-registered women as registered prostitutes, many of whom are victims of sex trafficking, and child prostitution in many instances has increased in these countries. Amsterdam has become a destination for sex tourism since the decriminalization of prostitution in the Netherlands in 2000. The ChildRight organization in Amsterdam estimated that the number of children involved in prostitution rose from 4,000 in 1996 to 15,000 children in 2001. In Had been argued that legalization would make conditions safer for those involved in prostitution. In Germany, where brothel prostitution is legal, Farley et al. observed: "59% of respondents told us that they did not think that legal prostitution made them any safer from rape or physical assault." Legalization has led to an increase in juvenile prostitution in countries where is has been implemented. The legalization of prostitution has not reduced harm, violence, organized crime or human trafficking.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>167</sup> Volpe et al., Juvenile "Prostitution" in Toronto, 11.

<sup>168</sup> Ibid

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>169</sup> Ibid., 12

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>170</sup> Farley et al. "Prostitution and Trafficking in Nine Countries," 49.

### 4.4. Influence of the Nordic model

The "Nordic Model" refers to the laws surrounding prostitution adopted by Sweden in 1999, with similar laws adopted by various other Nordic Countries. These laws criminalize pimps and customers while decriminalizing the activities of prostituted people.<sup>171</sup> The results of these laws are as follows:

Since the introduction of the Swedish law in 1999, street prostitution in Sweden decreased by 50%, and there was no increase in indoor prostitution (massage, sex clubs, hotels, restaurants) during that period. On the other hand, during the same period of time, both street and indoor prostitution in Norway and Denmark dramatically increased. There has been an increase in Internet-advertised prostitution in all Nordic countries including Sweden. The Swedish ban on the purchase of sex counteracted the establishment of organized crime groups in Sweden, resulting in Sweden's extremely low rate of trafficking compared with other members of the European Union. 172

It is interesting to note that the increase in Internet-advertised prostitution has not resulted in an increase in indoor prostitution in Sweden. The difference in outcomes between Sweden, Norway, and Denmark are largely related to the implementation of the laws and the support offered to prostituted people. The number of women involved in street prostitution in Stockholm had been reduced by two thirds in the five years after the Nordic model was implemented. The Nordic Model has meant the dramatic decrease of prostitution, organized crime, and human trafficking in Sweden. The results of this model have not come about solely through the crafting of the law, but through the ways these laws are implemented.

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>171</sup> Volpe et al., Juvenile "Prostitution" in Toronto, 12.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>172</sup> Farley et al., "Attitudes and Social Characteristics of Men Who Buy Sex in Scotland," 380.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>173</sup> Volpe et al., *Juvenile "Prostitution" in Toronto*, 12.

<sup>174</sup> Ibid.

# 4.5. The Protection of Communities and Exploited Persons Act (Bill C-36)

New prostitution laws were introduced by then Justice Minister Peter MacKay on June 4, 2014 through The Protection of Communities and Exploited Persons Act, (Bill C-36). The months following its introduction involved the reading, review and debate of this Bill before it was granted Royal Assent on November 6, 2014. In his speech at the second reading, Peter MacKay stated,

The impact of the new prohibitions would be borne predominantly by those who purchase sex and persons who exploit others through prostitution. The bill is intended to reduce demands for prostitution, which disproportionately impact on society's most marginalized and vulnerable. <sup>175</sup>

The previous prostitution laws show the differences that can exist between the intention, writing, implementation and enforcement of the laws. Research found that creating stricter penalties on the purchase of sex including jail time and higher fines would significantly deter purchasers, but only if they believed that such laws would be enforced. Naming men who purchase sex as sex offenders removes the glamour of prostitution. Research suggests that categorizing those who purchase sex as sex offenders does deter them from purchasing sex by removing the glamour of prostitution. Laws that seek to deter the purchase of sex and end the demand are only effective if enforced. Research suggests that categorizing those who prostitution.

Bill C-36 seeks to create prohibitions and stricter punishments on the purchase of sex and on the exploitation of another person for the purpose of prostitution. The purchase of sex or

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>175</sup> Peter MacKay, "Protection of Communities and Exploited Persons Act," (speech, House of Commons Debates, 41<sup>st</sup> Parliament, 2<sup>nd</sup> Session, Ottawa, June 11, 2014,

http://www.parl.gc.ca/HousePublications/Publication.aspx?DocId=6663588&Language=E&Mode=1 (accessed: July 17, 2015)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>176</sup> Farley et al., "Attitudes and Social Characteristics of Men Who Buy Sex in Scotland," 376

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>177</sup> Ibid., 379.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>178</sup> Ibid., 376.

communicating to purchase sex is prohibited under the Bill.<sup>179</sup> The Bill seeks to eliminate the material benefit of prostitution that is derived in exploitative ways.<sup>180</sup> The minimum sentence for procuring is increased under this Bill, which seeks to create greater consistency between prostitution offences and the existing human trafficking offences.<sup>181</sup> Limitations are placed on where soliciting can occur in order to protect children, youth and communities from the exposure of the sale of sex as a commodity.<sup>182</sup> The coercion and restraint inflicted on individuals involved in prostitution by traffickers and the purchasers of sex has seen the definition of weapons of restraint and prohibitions against using or intending to use such weapons.<sup>183</sup> It is hoped that restraint, forced confinement and the horrific crimes such as those committed by Robert Pickton will no longer occur in Canada. The protection of young people and the prevention of juvenile prostitution through law making were reflected in the creation of the Bill.

The Canadian political landscape is constantly changing and election promises often include changes in particular laws. Bill C-36 was passed under a Conservative majority government and a Senate with a majority of Conservative seats. Prime Minister Justin Trudeau has suggested that he would repeal the prostitution law. Trudeau is not the only Liberal leader to question the new laws; Ontario Premier Kathleen Wynne questioned their constitutionality. Wynne asked

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>179</sup> Parliament of Canada, "Summary," *Statutes of Canada 2014* (Ottawa: Parliament of Canada, 2014), a. http://www.parl.gc.ca/HousePublications/Redirector.aspx?RefererUrl=%2fHousePublications%2fPublication.aspx% 3fLanguage%3dE%26Mode%3d1%26DocId%3d6767128%26File%3d19)&File=19 (accessed July 17, 2015).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>180</sup> MacKay, "Protection of Communities and Exploited Persons Act,"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>181</sup> Parliament of Canada 2014, "Summary," d, f.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>182</sup> Ibid., e.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>183</sup> Ibid.,g.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>184</sup> Shawn McCarthy, "Trudeau urges 'evidence-based approach' on marijuana, prostitution laws," *Globe and Mail* (January 4, 2015), http://www.theglobeandmail.com/news/politics/trudeau-urges-evidence-based-approach-on-marijuana-prostitution-laws/article22285641/ (accessed July 8, 2015).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>185</sup> Keith Leslie, "Ontario will follow prostitution law despite concerns, says Kathleen Wynne," *Toronto Star* (December 19, 2014), http://www.thestar.com/news/canada/2014/12/19/ontario\_will\_follow\_prostitution law despite concerns says kathleen wynne.html (accessed July 17, 2015).

the Attorney General of Ontario to investigate whether they were constitutional. <sup>186</sup> There is concern that limiting where communication for prostitution occurs will criminalize the exploited or force such communication to occur under conditions that are unsafe. <sup>187</sup> The law change is too recent to comment on its implementation and outcomes. The future of Bill C-36 is as uncertain as the future of political leadership in Canada. Whether or not the Bill stays in its present form will likely be determined by the political landscape, the implementation of the Bill and outcomes observed.

\_

<sup>186</sup> Ibid.

<sup>187</sup> Ibid.

### Chapter 3

# Towards a Pastoral, Practical and Missional Response

### 1. A Pastoral Portrait

The central work of pastoral theology is to care for the most vulnerable persons in society. 
Sexually exploited young people are amongst the most vulnerable, and thus it is incumbent upon pastoral theology to care for those exploited through the commercial sex trade. Practical theology and pastoral theology are interrelated terms and disciplines. Practical theology is a "way of understanding theology in practice" by the Church and pastoral care providers. Bonnie Miller-McLemore differentiates between the terms, stating: "Whereas practical theology is integrative, concerned with broader issues of ministry, discipleship and formation, pastoral theology is person and pathos-centred and focused on the activity of care." The ways the Church puts theology into practice reveals how the Church defines and participates in mission. The response to juvenile prostitution holds implications for missiology, as the Church seeks to participate in *missio Dei*, God's mission at work in the world.

# 1.1. ARISE Ministry and Brooklyn's Story

ARISE Ministry is a mission of the Presbytery of East Toronto which offers outreach, case management, and pastoral care to individuals involved in the sex trade. ARISE is an acronym standing for Advocacy and Reclaiming Individuals involved in the Sex-trade through Empowerment, and reflects biblical images of rising with hope. We worked closely with the Mission Convenor of the Presbytery of East Toronto in creating the proposal for the vision and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>188</sup> Couture, Seeing Children, Seeing God, 13.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>189</sup> Miller-McLemore, "The Contributions of Practical Theology," 5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>190</sup> Ibid., 6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>191</sup> ARISE Ministry, "Home," https://ariseministry.wordpress.com/home/ (accessed January 4, 2016).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>192</sup> ARISE Ministry, "Our Story," https://ariseministry.wordpress.com/our-story/ (accessed January 4, 2016).

founding of ARISE. The Presbytery of East Toronto approved the proposal for ARISE Ministry as a mission of the Presbytery in October 2013 and appointed me the Director. <sup>193</sup>

Through ARISE I have had the privilege of journeying with Brooklyn. <sup>194</sup> Our journey has shaped my understanding of how to respond in pastoral, practical, and missional ways to juvenile prostitution. This is Brooklyn's story:

When we met, Brooklyn was homeless, in and out of the shelter system and couch-surfing. She was addicted to crack and used the sex trade to support her habit. As my call to ministry with individuals involved in the sex-trade grew, so did our relationship. When Brooklyn first saw me doing street outreach on the prostitution strolls, she would often hide. She said that she was ashamed to be seen that way.

I started meeting with Brooklyn one-on-one. She hated setting goals, she wasn't sure she could change or even that she wanted to [sic] change. In frustration and despair, Brooklyn would plead with me to just give up on her. But we continued on our journey together.

Brooklyn left the sex trade and we journeyed from addiction to sobriety; from homelessness to being housed; through trauma, tragedy and hopelessness; from near-death to new life.

At this point in her journey, Brooklyn is three years into her sobriety. She has an apartment, and life, for the most part, is going well. Several months ago when Brooklyn discovered she was pregnant, she wanted to meet with me to get support around her pregnancy. She knew there was a lot to do before the baby came and wanted someone to keep her on track with her goals.

I was amazed each week as Brooklyn achieved every goal she put down. Just six weeks after she told me she was pregnant, her apartment was stocked with everything she would need to bring home a baby.

Brooklyn asked me to be there with her in the hospital when she gave birth to her beautiful, healthy baby boy. What a privilege to walk together. It has been an incredible journey! 195

Journeying with Brooklyn taught me practically and experientially to understand and embrace a woman dealing with addiction and working in the sex trade. I was inspired by how nurturing

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>193</sup> The Presbytery of East Toronto, "Mission Committee Report" *Minutes* October 1, 2013, 14-15.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>194</sup> "Brooklyn" is a street name. Brooklyn was aware, participatory in, and consenting of the publication of her story in the promotion of ARISE Ministry. Brooklyn's story was part of The Story of Mission Report submitted to the Canadian Ministries Office of The Presbyterian Church in Canada by ARISE Ministry in the Fall of 2014. The story has since been published in *Stories of Mission: Sowing Seeds of Hope*, eds. Heather Chappell and Karen Plater. <sup>195</sup> Deb Rapport, "An incredible journey," in *Stories of Mission: Sowing Seeds of Hope*, eds. Heather Chappell and Karen Plater, (Toronto: The Presbyterian Church in Canada, 2015), 8.

strengths and supportive relationships fostered resiliency within Brooklyn. Reaching out to Brooklyn required respect and active waiting. Brooklyn's pregnancy gave her a renewed sense of purpose and a desire for transformative change.

# 1.2. Responding to Brooklyn's Story

Brooklyn's story is personal, however the pastoral needs and response to these needs can be understood and applied more broadly. Brooklyn's story helps frame a view for what a pastoral, practical, and missional response to juvenile prostitution in Canada might entail. The pastoral response to juvenile prostitution given in this chapter is framed by connecting the Canadian realities of juvenile prostitution as explored in Chapter 2 with practical theology and missiology.

This chapter begins by examining the responses of the Church towards prostitution historically and theologically. This examination of the responses of the Church from "Other" to "Embrace," draws upon Miroslav Volf's writings on "Embracing the Other" The chapter will then build upon the risk factors outlined in Chapter 2, to explore how resiliency can be fostered through youth ministry. The chapter proceeds to invite readers to understand outreach as reaching out in love by examining practical understandings and qualities of effective outreach. The chapter concludes with a discussion of empowerment and transformation as applied to exiting the sex trade and the ongoing pastoral care needs in supporting survivors of sexual exploitation. Each section includes an exploration of the implications for *missio Dei*.

# 2. Response of the Church: From "Other" to Embrace

Christian theology's response and approach to the sex trade has not traditionally been a compassionate understanding of pastoral needs. Rather, the Church's response has often included

. .

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>196</sup> Miroslav Volf, "Embracing the Other," *The Princeton Theological Review X*, no. 2 (2004): 4-9.

apathy, exclusion, and blame. Pastoral theologians, Maxine Glaz and Jeanne Stevenson Moessner state, "The recognition of pastoral need is inevitably made as a social and theological judgment that is contingent on a contextual understanding of who warrants care and what issues invoke concern." 197 The social and theological judgments and understandings of the sex trade have generally been focused on concern for the wider society, rather than for the young people being sexually exploited.

The shifts in conversations around juvenile prostitution in Canada that were occurring in the 1980s, as discussed in the previous chapter, were simultaneously occurring in the Church. A group of clergy from Vancouver gathered together in the 1980s to address the Special Committee on Pornography and Prostitution, stating:

It is the responsibility of the religious community to speak out against the human degradation that is part of prostitution and street soliciting. The effects on attitudes toward sexuality, relationships and community ...[are] devastating. 198

This group of clergy recognized that there was a pastoral need, but Canadian churches have made sparse effort to respond to this pastoral need. Who does and does not warrant care, and what issues do and do not invoke concern, reveal not only social and theological judgments, but also the presence of social apathy. A sense of "otherness" perpetuates and maintains the apathy connected with these judgments. Miroslav Volf discusses the need to embrace the other by seeking understanding through inclusive engagement. This embrace is not only necessary in confronting and challenging apathy, but in living out the *missio Dei*.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>197</sup> Maxine Glaz and Jeanne Stevenson Moessner, "Travail as Transition," in *Women in Travail and Transition: A New Pastoral Care* ed. Maxine Glaz and Jeanne Stevenson Moessner (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1991), 188.
 <sup>198</sup> Special Committee on Pornography and Prostitution (Canada), *Pornography and Prostitution in Canada*, 350.
 <sup>199</sup> Volf, "Embracing the Other," 5.

# 2.1. Historical Theological Response to Prostitution

Christian theology is not one united voice when it comes to understanding prostitution.

Theologians throughout the history of Christianity, from Augustine to the Reformers to the present have held differing opinions on prostitution. Though repulsed by prostitution, Augustine viewed prostitutes as necessary for social order without which lust would consume and destroy the world. Aquinas affirmed Augustine's position, and believed that prostitution was an example of an evil that must be tolerated so that greater evils are not incurred. The Reformers challenged the understanding of prostitution as a necessary evil, and Couture states:

The reformers challenged that view and attempted to eradicate prostitution, initiating an understanding of sexual relationships as contributing to human relationality and procreation. This standard was to direct the sexual drives of both men and women. Although they blamed prostitutes for seduction, they were willing to undermine the tentacles of prostitution by providing prostitutes with the economic means to leave the brothel.<sup>202</sup>

The traditional theological understanding and approach to prostitution has been one of blaming, deficitizing, and excluding, all of which have contributed to a sense of apathy. Miroslav Volf discusses embrace of "the other" and the "logic of purity." This is the exclusive notion, which suggests that external elements must not enter the proper space so as to disturb purity. <sup>204</sup> Christian theology has traditionally and historically responded from the logic of purity with

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>200</sup> Augustine, *On Order [De Ordine]* trans. Silvanno Borrusso, (South Bend: St. Augustine's Press, 2007), 65 (2.4). <sup>201</sup> St. Aquinas, *Summa Theologica: First Complete American Edition in Three Volumes, Volume 2*, trans. Fathers of the English Dominican Province, (New York: Benziger Brothers, 1947), 1222 (2-2.10.11).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>202</sup> Pamela D. Couture, *Blessed Are The Poor? Women's Poverty, Family Policy and Practical Theology* (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1991), 193 n.27.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>203</sup> Volf, "Embracing the Other," 4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>204</sup> Ibid.

respect to the sex trade.<sup>205</sup> The logic of purity has been insufficient in caring for the vulnerable, promoting justice, or living out *missio Dei* in response to juvenile prostitution.

# 2.2. Challenging Apathy

The apathy of both the Church and society towards the sex trade is perpetuated and maintained by the logic of purity. Apathy towards the sex trade most broadly, and juvenile prostitution specifically, are not limited to the Church. Indifference towards prostitution and trafficking has contributed to its continued existence. Furthermore, the violence that sex workers experience is a manifestation of stigma, blame, and discrimination. The language of deficit, blame, and exclusion must be challenged to make way for compassion, understanding, and inclusion.

Challenging apathy includes recognizing and drawing attention to the environmental hazards and risk factors that contribute to sexual exploitation. This means recognizing where and how the social safety net has failed and advocating for change. Advocacy is the work of the Church and must also include the elimination of sexual stereotypes.<sup>208</sup> The determination of pastoral need is a social and theological statement about who and what invokes care and concern.<sup>209</sup> Implicitly, this determination of pastoral need becomes a statement about *missio Dei*, and about who and what might be important to God. Apathy, traditional understandings, and the logic of purity must be challenged in response to the realities of juvenile prostitution. Rita Nakashima Brock and Susan Brooks Thistlethwaite challenge the religious community and traditional understandings of prostitution, stating:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>205</sup> Bartley, *Prostitution*, 1-2, 25; John R. Graham, "William Lyon Mackenzie King, Elizabeth Harvie, and Edna: A Prostitute Rescuing Initiative in Late Victorian Toronto," *The Canadian Journal of Human Sexuality* 8, no. 1 (1999): 55-56.

Melissa Farley et al., "Prostitution and Trafficking in Nine Countries," 65.

World Health Organization, "Violence against sex workers and HIV Prevention," 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>208</sup> Maria Harris, *Portrait of Youth Ministry*, (New York: Paulist Press, 1981), 143, 149.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>209</sup> Glaz and Moessner, "Travail as Transition," 188.

How we understand sin and karma must change in light of the reality of the sexual exploitation of children and women. The prostitute, far from being the repentant sinner or the victim of her own karma, suffers from the accumulation of *han* in her soul as she lives within this structure, which makes all of her choices fall between bad and worse.<sup>210</sup>

*Han* is a concept from Korean culture and theology that expresses the experience of oppressive and exploitive suffering, and the accompanying sense of hopelessness and defeat.<sup>211</sup> *Han* is used in the quote above to describe the oppression, exploitation, and accompanying sense of powerlessness that sexually exploited individuals face. Naming individuals involved in prostitution as sinners or victims of their own karma contributes to this suffering and sense of hopelessness.

Understanding the risks, realities, and lack of choice surrounding sexual exploitation and juvenile prostitution is essential. This understanding confronts apathy and strives for justice, inclusion, and embrace. Justice issues and concerns have been part of the Church's witness throughout its history. Protecting the vulnerable includes challenging the discomfort and apathy felt towards discussing issues of human sexuality with young people. Maria Harris discusses the importance of youth being able to raise their questions and concerns about a wide-range of issues involving human sexuality with trusted adults. Harris stresses the importance of providing young people with adequate information on the topic of human sexuality in order to empower them to act in responsible ways. Adolescents involved in prostitution often have not had reliable education regarding sexuality, pregnancy, contraception, and sexually transmitted

<sup>2</sup> 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>210</sup> Rita Nakashima Brock and Susan Brooks Thistlethwaite, *Casting Stones: Prostitution and Liberation in Asia and the United States* (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1996), 267.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>211</sup> Sang Taek Lee, *Religion and Social Formation in Korea: Minjung and Millenarianism* (Berlin: Mouton de Gruyter, 1996), 57.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>212</sup> Harris, Portrait of Youth Ministry, 145.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>213</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>214</sup> Ibid.

diseases. 215 Protection of the vulnerable and speaking out against injustice was an important part of the message, witness, and gospel of Jesus Christ. Challenging apathy towards sex trafficking and sexual exploitation must involve the congregational, denominational, and ecumenical efforts of the Church to move from exclusion to embrace.

#### 2.3. From Rescue to Embrace

Evangelical Protestantism of the Edwardian and Victorian eras involved prostitute rescue missions. 216 John R. Graham writes of a prostitute rescuing initiative called The Haven in Toronto, and the efforts its president Elizabeth Harvie and William Lyon Mackenzie King took to rescue Edna, a young woman involved in prostitution.<sup>217</sup> The men and women who ran The Haven are described by Graham as, "members of the Canadian business, social, and political elite, and were evangelical Protestants from a variety of denominational backgrounds."<sup>218</sup> Similarly, prostitution rescue and reform in England was about working-class women being saved by their middle-class 'superiors;' working-class women were sought out, stigmatized and subsequently rescued by members of the middle-class with the time, money and social connections to achieve this rescue.<sup>219</sup> Prostitution rescuing operated out of a theology of fighting the forces of evil and darkness by helping the spiritual rise above the flesh. <sup>220</sup> During this time and out of this theology a variety of institutions were established to rehabilitate prostitutes and make them 'respectable.'221

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>215</sup> Melissa Farley, "Bad for the Body, Bad for the Heart," 1098.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>216</sup> Bartley, *Prostitution*, 4-6, 25, 198; Graham, "William Lyon Mackenzie King, Elizabeth Harvie, and Edna," 48,

<sup>55. &</sup>lt;sup>217</sup> Graham, "William Lyon Mackenzie King, Elizabeth Harvie, and Edna," 47.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>218</sup> Ibid., 48.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>219</sup> Bartley, *Prostitution*, 25.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>220</sup> Graham, "William Lyon Mackenzie King, Elizabeth Harvie and Edna," 55-56.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>221</sup> Bartley, *Prostitution*, 25.

Rescue approaches are implicitly deficitizing by naming prostitutes as individuals in need of rescue. Prostitution rescue missions of the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries preached repentance and saw prostitutes as women in need of moral and spiritual salvation. There are organizations serving prostitutes today that can be viewed as operating out of a rescue philosophy and framework. However, the approach in prostitution rescue ideology differs today as sex workers are seen by these organizations as victims of exploitation and patriarchy, rather than condemned sinners. Understanding sexually exploited individuals as survivors rather than victims has a profound impact on how they see themselves. The language and theology of rescuing victims of prostitution is othering and deficitizing, as individuals continue to be identified by their exploitation, rather than by their strength, courage, and resiliency in overcoming trauma.

# 2.4. Missio Dei and Embracing the "Other"

The movement from apathy to compassion, and from exclusion to embrace, is essential for understanding mission. Understanding, inclusion, and embrace of individuals involved in the sex trade are necessary as the Church seeks justice and responds to pastoral care needs. The shift from apathy to understanding and embrace is a reflection of *missio Dei*. The theological development of mission as *missio Dei*, is explored by David Bosch, who states:

We have to distinguish between *mission* (singular) and *missions* (plural). The first refers primarily to the *missio Dei* (God's mission), that is, God's self-revelation as One who loves the world, God's involvement in and with the world, the nature and activity of God, which embraces both the church and the world, and in which the church is privileged to participate. *Missio Dei* enunciates the good news that God is a God-for-people.<sup>225</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>222</sup> Ibid., 198.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>223</sup> Ibid., 198.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>224</sup> Coy, "Young Women, Local Authority Care, and Selling Sex," 20-21.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>225</sup> Bosch, Transforming Mission, 10.

The participation in God's activity of love for the world is what it means to be missional. The term *missio* is related to the doctrine and dogma of the trinity, namely the godly self-sending, the sending of the Son and the Holy Spirit into the world.<sup>226</sup>

*Missio Dei* is divine embrace of the other, as God reaches out to humanity in love. The willingness to embrace and love the other in relation to God's love is further explained by Miroslav Volf:

We are created not to isolate ourselves from other but to engage them, indeed, to contribute to their flourishing, as we nurture our own identity and attend to our own well-being. Finally, for Christians, the most important reason for willing not only to live with others but to positively embrace them is the character of God's love as displayed in Jesus Christ. Jesus Christ died for all human beings because he loved them all.<sup>227</sup>

Inclusion, engagement, and embrace of the other is the character of God as shown in God's mission, inclusion, engagement and embrace of the whole of creation. *Koinonia* is an element of the ministry and mission of the Church directed to a healing of divisions and a striving for wholeness. <sup>228</sup> *Koinonia* is part of this missional embrace. The movement to end apathy and embrace the other is participation in the *missio Dei*.

# 3. Fostering Resiliency through Youth Ministry

Preventing the sexual exploitation of young people through juvenile prostitution involves fostering resiliency. Entry age, gender, race, poverty, home experiences, homelessness, lack of school engagement, and involvement in state-run systems were all named and described as risk factors in Chapter 2. Many of these risk factors are outside the control of the individual and the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>226</sup> Karl Barth, "Theology and Mission in Present Times," *Speech delivered to the Bradenburg Mission Conference* trans. Karsten Decker, (Berlin, 1932), 19.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>227</sup> Volf, "Embracing the Other," 6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>228</sup> Harris, *Portrait of Youth Ministry*, 19.

result of inequities within one's environment.<sup>229</sup> Fostering resiliency equips young people with the strength and support needed to withstand the various risk factors present in their lives.<sup>230</sup> Practical theologian, Pamela Couture writes, "Every child needs a cushion against the risk factors in his or her family or neighbourhood. The poorer the child, economically and in family and social connections, the greater that need."<sup>231</sup> The church has a role in cushioning against the risks and fostering resiliency through ministry with children and youth.

Resiliency is the powerful strength within an individual to overcome adversity, environmental hazards, and risk factors.<sup>232</sup> Youth ministry, which is vital and missional, minimizes risks and strengthens resiliency in the lives of young people. The common attributes of resilient children are social competence, problem solving skills, autonomy and sense of purpose.<sup>233</sup> These attributes are conceptualized in Brendtro, Brokenleg, and Van Bockern's model of the "Circle of Courage," as belonging, mastery, independence and generosity and deemed necessary factors for resiliency.<sup>234</sup> The importance of these factors is reinforced in understandings of youth ministry. Fulfilling the need for belonging is accomplished through trustworthy relationships that can overcome disappointment.<sup>235</sup> In the Church the need for belonging is met in two ways: relationship to the community or congregation, and relationship to the divine.<sup>236</sup> Nurturing the

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>229</sup> Bonnie Benard, Fostering Resiliency in Kids: Protective Factors in the Family, School and Community (Portland: Northwest Regional Educational Laboratory, 1991), 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>230</sup> Brendtro and Larson, *The Resilience Revolution*, 33, 45, 78.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>231</sup> Couture, Seeing Children, Seeing God, 40.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>232</sup> Brendtro and Larson, Resilience Revolution, 33.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>233</sup> Benard, Fostering Resilience in Kids, 5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>234</sup> Brendtro, Brokenleg and Van Bockern, *Reclaiming Youth At Risk*, 60-61.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>235</sup> Ibid., 73; Pamela Couture, *Child Poverty: Love, Justice and Social Responsibility* (St. Louis: Chalice Press, 2007), 44; Kenda Creasy Dean, *Practicing Passion: Youth and the Quest for a Passionate Church* (Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2004), 56; Larson and Brendtro, *Reclaiming Our Prodigal Sons and Daughters*, 114; Larry Brendtro and Mary Shahbazian, *Troubled Children and Youth: Turning Problems into Opportunities* (Illinois: Research Press, 2004), 91.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>236</sup> Mary Elizabeth Mullino Moore, "Yearnings, Hopes, and Visions: Youth Dreams and Ministry Futures," in *Children, Youth, and Spirituality in a Troubling World*, ed. Mary Elizabeth Moore and Almeda M. Wright (St. Louis: Chalice Press, 2008), 117-118, 120.

skills of young people as part of faith formation provides support against the sense of failure or alienation that some young people experience in the education system.<sup>237</sup> Independence is fostered when youth are respected, given agency, and trusted with responsibility.<sup>238</sup> Opportunities to discover a sense of purpose are meaning making for young people and offer the possibility to explore vocation.<sup>239</sup> A youth ministry that fosters resiliency prevents involvement in juvenile prostitution, and mitigates against the other risks threatening young people.

# 3.1. Relationships and Resiliency

The trauma of abuse and adverse childhood experiences cause hurt that is personal and relational. Childhood physical and sexual abuse, <sup>240</sup> time in foster care, <sup>241</sup> and parental addiction <sup>242</sup> were shown to be prevalent in the lives of those involved in the sex trade, as explored in the previous chapter. Identity emerges as a young person's needs are met in mutually significant caring relationships; shame ensues when these interpersonal needs are broken or unmet. <sup>243</sup> When the need for love remains unsatisfied, it produces conflict in the lives of young people as they seek to have this need met. <sup>244</sup> Human relationships are essential in creating and fostering resiliency. <sup>245</sup> For it is in community where we become our truest selves. <sup>246</sup>

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>237</sup> Harris, *Portrait of Youth Ministry*, 183-184; Larson and Brendtro, *Reclaiming Our Prodigal Sons and Daughters*, 48; Brendtro and Larson, *Resilience Revolution*, 79.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>238</sup> Brendtro and Larson, *Resilience Revolution*, 104-105; Brentro, Brokenleg and Van Bockern, *Reclaiming Youth at Risk*, 64, 112.

Moore, "Yearning, Hopes and Visions," 121-122; Brendro and Larson, Resilience Revolution, 132-133.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>240</sup> Williamson and Prior, "Domestic Minor Sex Trafficking," 51.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>241</sup> Volpe, Talwar and Hunter, Juvenile "Prostitution" in Toronto, 15.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>242</sup> Williamson and Prior, "Domestic Minor Sex Trafficking," 52.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>243</sup> Ramsay, "Sexual Abuse and Shame," 113.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>244</sup> August Aichhorn, Wayward Youth: A Psychoanalytic Study of Delinquent Children (New York: Meridian Books, 1957), 115.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>245</sup> Martin Brokenleg, "The Resilience Revolution: Our Original Collaboration," *Reclaiming Children and Youth* v. 18 n. 4. (2010): 11.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>246</sup> Mark Yaconelli, *Contemplative Youth Ministry: Practicing the Presence of Jesus* (Grand Rapids: Youth Specialties, 2006), 144.

Young people have a deep desire for authentic relationships with adults. 247 and more adult role models need to be available for them. <sup>248</sup> Relationships of unconditional love meet the need for belonging.

Youth ministry must address the yearning for relationship, and this responsibility is two-fold: it involves both relationship with the community and relationship with God.<sup>249</sup> At-risk young people have often experienced relationships of disappointment with the adults in their lives, making them "adult-wary." <sup>250</sup> Entry into child protective care can lead to feelings of betrayal when the promised safety was not provided. <sup>251</sup> Pamela Couture writes, "The children, youth, and those who care for them, whether in our own communities or globally, need sustained, trustworthy relationships - relationships that transcend disappointment. <sup>252</sup> In order for children, youth and their families to transcend disappointment and trauma, trusting relationships must be fostered, nurtured and sustained.<sup>253</sup> Congregations provide possibilities for intergenerational connections to be formed in meaningful ways. Peter Vanacore discusses the importance of a mentoring ministry, stating, "While some seek mentors, many of our youth are at best alienated and at worst completely separated from adults who can provide them much-needed help."<sup>254</sup> Mentors combat the alienation young people face by providing a relationship with a caring adult.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>248</sup> Harris, Portrait of Youth Ministry, 220.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>249</sup> Moore, "Yearnings, Hopes, and Visions," 119.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>250</sup> J.C. Chambers and Mark Freado, "Kid Whispering and the Inside Kid," *Reclaiming Children and Youth* 17, no. 4 (2009): 42.

251 Coy, "Young Women, Local Authority Care, and Selling Sex," 1419.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>252</sup> Couture, *Child Poverty*, 44.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>253</sup> Search Institute, "40 Developmental Assets for Adolescents,"

Peter Vanacore, "Developing a Mentoring Ministry," in City Lights: Ministry Essentials for Reaching Urban Youth, ed. Scott Larson and Karen Free (Loveland: Group Publishing, 2003), 111.

The yearning for love and belonging is not only an emotional need, but is also deeply spiritual.<sup>255</sup> The yearning for the Holy is met in the Church with the Passion of Christ.<sup>256</sup> A passionate and missional youth ministry is intimately tied to the passion and mission of Christ.<sup>257</sup> Kenda Creasy Dean reflects on the importance of the Passion of Christ in youth ministry, stating:

The Passion of Christ is good news to adolescents, not because Jesus suffers, but because Jesus loves them with such wild, passionate hope that even death on a cross cannot stop his determination to win them. Adolescents do not want to suffer, but they do desperately want to love something worthy of suffering, and to be so loved.<sup>258</sup>

Children and youth at-risk are searching for a love full of passion and hope, that would risk all for all. This love is encapsulated in the passionate love of Christ. *Missio Dei* is God's relational self in the Trinity engaging with and loving the world. Missional and effective youth ministry is a reflection of such love, acceptance, and belonging.

# 3.2. Skill-based Spiritual Formation

Lack of school engagement correlates with juvenile prostitution and sex trade involvement.<sup>259</sup> Problems in school and feelings of alienation within the school system increase risk factors and decrease the resiliency of a young person to withstand such factors.<sup>260</sup> As discussed in the previous chapter, dropping out of school is common amongst young people involved in the sex trade. Scott Larson and Larry Brendtro state, "Most kids who formally drop out were not bonded to school in the first place."<sup>261</sup> Kennedy Saldanha's thesis work, "It's better to be bad than

<sup>258</sup> Kenda Creasy Dean, *Practicing Passion*, 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>255</sup> Moore, "Yearnings, Hopes, and Visions," 117.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>256</sup> Dean, *Practicing Passion*, 26.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>257</sup> Ibid, 2, 7, 18, 26, 56;

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>259</sup> Gaetz and O'Grady, "Making Money," 450; Gibbs Van Brunschot and Brannigan, "Childhood maltreatment and subsequent conduct disorders," 230.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>260</sup> Harris, Portrait of Youth Ministry, 183-184; Larson and Brentro, Reclaiming Our Prodigal Sons and Daughters, 48-49.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>261</sup> Ibid., 48.

stupid,"<sup>262</sup> explored the educational experiences of street-involved youth. Labeling and stigmatization caused youth to doubt mastery of skills and led to feelings of alienation within the education system. Nurturing the strengths and skills of young people celebrates who they are and what they can contribute; it shows youth that their gifts matter to the community. Resiliency is nurtured as youth understand their own skills and strengths, and are able to draw on them in times of difficulty. <sup>265</sup>

Nurturing the strength of children and youth empowers a sense of mastery; the knowledge that they have skills and talents to help them overcome challenges.<sup>266</sup> Resilience involves the ability to solve problems through the development of strengths and the overcoming of difficulties.<sup>267</sup> Nurturing the talents, strengths, and abilities of youth within a supportive community gives these young people the confidence and courage to face the problems in their lives.<sup>268</sup> A skills-based approach to Christian education and youth ministry nurtures strengths and fosters the needs young people have for mastery. Thomas Everson discusses the importance of such an approach to spiritual formation, stating:

...it is important to recognize the strengths of taking a skills-based approach to spiritual/moral formation with at-risk youth. This approach equips youth with the very real and necessary skills they can use to build meaningful relationships with God (Higher Power) and all people, and to live productive lives.<sup>269</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>262</sup> Saldanha, "It's better to be bad than stupid," 132.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>263</sup> Ibid

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>264</sup> Benard, Fostering Resiliency in Kids, 9.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>265</sup> Brendtro and Larson, *The Resilience Revolution*, 49-50.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>266</sup> Ibid., 78-79;

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>267</sup> Ibid., 78.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>268</sup> Ibid., 79.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>269</sup> Thomas J. Everson, "From Risk to Resiliency: Faith Skills for the Journey," in *The Ongoing Journey: Awakening Spiritual Life in At-Risk Youth*, ed. Terry Hyland and Ron Herron (Boys Town: Boys Town Press, 1995), 217.

The strengths and skills of students are difficult to nurture in an educational system that is burdened by large class sizes, curriculum changes, and staff strikes.<sup>270</sup> The Church must nurture resiliency in young people, fostering within them the skills necessary for building meaningful relationships and living productive lives. Spiritual formation nurtures resiliency in young people as they are empowered to find meaning in their lives.<sup>271</sup>

# 3.3. Encouraging Greatness

Responsibility is taught through opportunities where young people are treated as and expected to be responsible. Young people are frequently dismissed as irresponsible and denied responsibility, respect and independence. Responsibility is a developmental asset and contributes to a young person's ability to be resilient. Establishing high expectations for children plays an important role in developing resiliency, and faith is a related aspect of these high expectations. Youth unemployment not only creates economic desperation, it also denies young people opportunities for responsibility. The correlation between unemployment and prostitution was explored in the previous chapter. Though it may be difficult for congregations to provide employment opportunities for all of their youth, they can provide opportunities for young people to gain responsibility and independence, thus nurturing resiliency.

Congregations must be places where young people are treated with respect. This means providing young people with choice, agency, and responsibility.<sup>275</sup> Dignity and respect are entwined, as dignity is imparted by giving young people responsibility to demonstrate their

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>270</sup> Diane Ravitch, *The death and life of the great American school system: How testing and choice are undermining education.* (New York: Basic Books, 2010).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>271</sup> Brendtro and Larson, *Resilience Revolution*, 129-131.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>272</sup> Ibid 104

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>273</sup> Search Institute, "40 Developmental Assets for Adolescents,"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>274</sup> Benard, Fostering Resiliency in Kids, 8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>275</sup> Brendtro and Larson, Resilience Revolution, 104-105, 109-110;

greatness.<sup>276</sup> This means not only encouraging greatness from youth, but also expecting that they are capable of such greatness. When young people are given responsibilities, the message communicated is that they are worthy and capable of contributing.<sup>277</sup> Kenda Creasy Dean cautions, "when teenagers are neither expected nor encouraged to pull themselves together, they tend to 'fall apart' instead."<sup>278</sup> Mark Yaconelli states, "Youth ministry is about holding a young person's deepest identity until he or she is able to see it too."<sup>279</sup> Holding that identity and the expectation of greatest for young people is transformative. Seeking maturity in faith and expecting youth to live faithfully helps inspire responsibility, respect, and maturity; contributing to their resiliency.

Responsibility is not about telling youth what rules they must abide by, but rather helping them articulate their own faith.<sup>280</sup> The practice of testimony is one way in which faith is articulated.<sup>281</sup> Young people need to hear the stories of other Christians and desire engagement in truthful conversations with adults about the struggles of life.<sup>282</sup> The sharing of testimony can be a powerful experience for young people, as Almeda Wright states,

The practice of testimony empowers youth to 'tell it like it is,' not to be ashamed of their experiences, but to share their experiences in the hope and knowledge that their stories will be received by an encouraging community, and will also serve as encouragement for others. The practice of testimony aids in the process of helping youth find their authentic voice, a voice constructed and reconstructed in light of communal witnessing and listening.<sup>283</sup>

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>276</sup> Marty Mitchell, Christi Tobin and John Seita, "Principles Undergirding Healthy People," in *In Whose Best Interest? One Child's Odyssey, a Nation's Responsibility*, ed. John Seita, Martin Mitchell, and Christi Tobin (Elizabethtown: Continental Press, 1996), 98.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>277</sup> Benard, Fostering Resiliency in Kids, 9.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>278</sup> Dean, *Practicing Passion*, 61.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>279</sup> Yaconelli, Contemplative Youth Ministry, 121.

Moore, "Yearning, Hopes, and Visions," 117, 121; Harris, Portrait of Youth Ministry, 40-41, 152;

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>281</sup> Yaconelli, *Contemplative Youth Ministry*, 209-211; Almeda M. Wright, "The Power of Testimonies: Spiritual Formation and Ministering with Youth," in *Children, Youth, and Spirituality in a Troubling World* ed. Mary Elizabeth Moore and Almeda M. Wright (St. Louis: Chalice Press, 2008), 195.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>282</sup> Wright, "The Power of Testimonies," 209.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>283</sup> Wright, "The Power of Testimonies,"195.

Providing youth with opportunities to find their voice, discover their identity, and articulate their faith shows youth that the choices they make matter. When the community listens earnestly to the stories of youth and encourages them in their faith development, that community is treating youth with respect, nurturing resiliency, and encouraging greatness.

# 3.4. Purpose and Opportunity

Loss of purpose is a threat to a young person's sense of identity, fulfillment, and resilience.<sup>284</sup> Poverty threatens the sense of purpose in the lives of children and youth. Pamela Couture discusses the ways poverty impacts resiliency, stating:

Children who are economically poor face many of the same problems as children with more economic means, yet poverty concentrates problems in the lives of poor children, and their families have fewer resources with which to respond.<sup>285</sup>

When resources are allocated to survival, there is little attention given to what gives life purpose, meaning, and fulfillment. Poverty increases risk by undermining a young person's sense of purpose and significance.

Young people need opportunities for learning, growth, and self-discovery to explore their own strengths, skills, and sense of purpose. Seita, Mitchell, and Tobin state, "Without opportunity, young people feel that life has no purpose." These opportunities include experiencing reciprocal generosity, and cultivating hope and purpose. Helping teach Sunday school, run the sound system, or lead worship are opportunities for youth to develop and explore their strengths. Opportunities within the faith community allow youth to explore the way their strengths, talents, and abilities contribute to helping the community.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>284</sup> Brendtro, Brokenleg and Van Bockern, *Reclaiming Youth at Risk*, 34.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>285</sup> Couture, *Child Poverty*, 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>286</sup> Mitchell, Tobin and Seita, "Principles Undergirding Healthy People," 101.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>287</sup> Martin Brokenleg, "Native American Perspectives on Generosity," *Reclaiming Children and Youth* 8 no. 2. (1999): 67

The yearning of young people for purpose is a deep desire for vocation in life. <sup>288</sup> The opportunity to serve others is in itself meaning-making. <sup>289</sup> Congregations are comprised of individuals of different ages and abilities with a wide range of needs. The meeting of these needs does not belong to the pastor alone but to the community as a whole. Mary Elizabeth Mullino Moore states, "The yearning to make a difference stirs a vision of youth ministry that calls and equips young people in their vocation." Youth ministry needs to invite youth to passionate opportunities to serve, for such opportunities are transformative. Karen Marie Yust states, "Opportunities for those who are being served to offer service become a transformational gift for traumatized youth." When congregations live out of *missio Dei*, they offer young people opportunities to find their vocation as they seek after God's own heart. Vocation teaches youth that their lives have purpose and meaning, not only for themselves, but also for God and God's glory. <sup>292</sup> Opportunities for service provide youth a chance to discover meaning, purpose, and vocation in transformative ways.

# 3.5. Missio Dei and Resiliency Minded Youth Ministry

Successful prevention strategies and programs must equip young people with the strength they need to be resilient. A youth ministry, which nurtures resiliency, is effective, caring and missional. Pamela Couture states,

Christian theological tradition suggests that the care of children resides at the center of God's mission. It affirms that children are made in the image and likeness of God. It affirms likewise that as we care for or discard children, we care for or discard God.<sup>293</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>288</sup> Moore, "Yearning, Hopes, and Visions," 117, 121.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>289</sup> Brentro, Brokenleg and Van Bockern, *Reclaiming Youth at Risk*, 138.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>290</sup> Ibid., 121

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>291</sup> Karen Marie Yust, "(Non) Cosmetic Ministry: Reclaiming Hope Among Abused Adolescents," in *Children, Youth, and Spirituality in a Troubling World*, ed. Mary Elizabeth Moore and Almeda M. Wright, (St. Louis: Chalice Press, 2008), 135.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>292</sup> Moore, "Yearning, Hopes, and Visions," 121.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>293</sup> Couture, *Child Poverty*, 95.

Care for children and youth is thus a critical aspect of the *missio Dei*. Love and concern for young people is love and concern for God. The Passion of Christ is Good News for at-risk youth as they come to know that Jesus loves them with a wild, passionate hope.<sup>294</sup> Having a ministry for children and youth, which meets their spiritual, emotional, and developmental needs, and nurtures resiliency is critical. This involves fostering belonging through caring relationships, nurturing skills, expecting greatness, and providing opportunities to explore purpose.

Resiliency-minded youth ministry must not be understood as ministry *to* youth but rather, ministry *with* youth. A youth ministry that fosters resiliency invites young people to explore their own involvement in ministry. Ministry with youth invites young people to see themselves as called to participate in mission and discern the meaning of that calling in their own lives. This involves a community that nurtures skills, gives opportunities, and allows youth to discover purpose. Yaconelli writes,

I'm convinced that many of us are Christians today because some person or group of people listened to us, saw us, received and delighted in us. This is the kind of presence youth long for. This is the kind of presence Jesus embodied. This is the kind of presence we seek to incarnate to love young people into faith.<sup>296</sup>

Loving youth into faith means listening, seeing, receiving and delighting in young people as they discern the meaning of that faith in their lives. Dean writes, "Called to be 'set apart' for mission 'for such a time as this,' they proceed with a sense of purpose and belonging as they bring Christ's self-giving love into the world." Resiliency-minded youth ministry invites youth to know and participate in *missio Dei*, that is God's self-giving love for world.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>294</sup> Dean, *Practicing Passion*, 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>295</sup> Harris, Portrait of Youth Ministry, 221.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>296</sup> Yaconelli, Contemplative Youth Ministry, 101-102.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>297</sup> Dean, *Practicing Passion*, 142.

## 4. Outreach: Reaching Out in Love

Outreach is sending; the nature and purpose of this sending is interpreted in varied ways according to discipline and context. For social service work, outreach refers to particular model of service delivery. Outreach is defined by Able-Peterson and Bucy "as sending social services or health delivery personnel away from a facility and into the arena where people live or congregate." For the Church, outreach has at times become synonymous with an evangelism that seeks to proselytize, and make "the other" like us; such an understanding is neither outreach nor evangelism. Charles Fensham states, "Evangelism is welcoming the stranger. Evangelism is not proselytizing. Evangelism is not conversion. Evangelism is not making the other like us." When outreach is conceptualized by the Church as being sent, then it follows that outreach must be understood as intrinsically linked to the *missio Dei*, God's sending. Bryan Stone discusses what it means for a church to understand its calling as being sent, stating:

A church that does not reflect adequately its nature and calling as *sent* – a church, in other words that is not characterized by eucharistic excess, overflowing donation, and generosity in its community – cannot be called an evangelizing church. Thus, evangelism can be measured by our 'reach' and how thoroughly we refuse to allow that 'reach' to be domesticated by the political boundaries and economic disciplines of other publics."<sup>300</sup>

Outreach, in other words, is the Church with kindness and generosity showing love to God's people and God's world. Pamela Couture states, "The central work of pastoral or congregational care is care for the most vulnerable persons in society, poor children." Outreach brings pastoral care to those most vulnerable by going out to meet them in their vulnerability.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>298</sup> Able-Peterson and Bucy, *The Street Outreach Training*, 15-16.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>299</sup> Charles Fensham, *Emerging from the Dark Age Ahead: The Future of the North American Church* (Toronto: Clements Academic, 2011), 168.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>300</sup> Bryan Stone, *Evangelism after Christendom: The Theology and Practice of Christian Witness* (Grand Rapids: Brazos Press, 2007), 273.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>301</sup> Couture, Seeing Children, Seeing God, 13.

Meeting people where they are is the essence of what outreach seeks to do. Outreach, is shaped by relationships and experience, which means being responsive to particular contexts.<sup>302</sup> Outreach means meeting individuals where they are - physically, mentally, emotionally, and spiritually. Outreach programs differ; some operate from a public health framework, offering a harm reduction approach in which condom distribution and the preventing the transmission of sexually transmitted diseases is the primary focus in service delivery. 303 The Archbishops' Council observed, "The gospel has to meet people where they are, before it can enter and affect their lives." Outreach is about meeting the needs of those being served as they express and identify them. Thus, outreach workers commonly utilize a client-centered approach. 305 Saldanha and Parenteau discuss the relationship between "perceived needs" and "actual needs" with respect to outreach. 306 Meeting the perceived needs of the individual builds trust and may lead to meeting actual needs. Pastoral theologians Maxine Glaz and Jeanne Stevenson Moessner state, "Pastoral care is not something that we do (or do not do) to others; empathic care takes its lead from the needs of others as they identify those needs." Pastoral care is about responding to the needs of others as they identify those needs.

# 4.1. A Practical Understanding of Outreach

Outreach is relational; the success or effectiveness of an outreach ministry or program must be evaluated by rapport. 308 Connolly and Joly observed a shared definition of outreach when they

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>302</sup> Saldanha and Parenteau, "'Well, if you can't smile you should go home!," 1276.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>303</sup> Ann Marie O'Connor, Women Working in Prostitution: Towards A Healthier Future (Dublin: Women's Education Research and Resource Centre, 1996), 23-24, 27-28.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>304</sup> The Archbishops' Council, Mission-Shaped Church: Church Planting and Fresh Expressions of Church in a Changing Context, (London: Church House Publishing, 2004), 6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>305</sup> J. A. Connolly and L. E. Joly, "Outreach with street-involved youth: A quantitative and qualitative review of the literature," Clinical Psychology Review 32 (2012): 531.

<sup>306</sup> Saldanha and Parenteau, "'Well, if you can't smile you should go home!'" 1280.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>308</sup> Saldanha and Parenteau, "Well, if you can't smile you should go home!" 1276, 1278, 1282.

compared programs providing outreach to street-youth.<sup>309</sup> This definition included three components, "meeting youth in their environment, forming a relationship with the youth, and then connecting them with a wide variety of services and information."<sup>310</sup> Making connections and building relationships are the first steps when helping someone who wants to leave the sex trade.<sup>311</sup> Successful outreach is often evaluated by level of engagement and outcomes; the point where the client's basic needs have been met and they feel empowered to further access services.<sup>312</sup> This engagement and the outcomes are developed through the outreach rapport.<sup>313</sup> Through the development of the outreach relationship, further connections are made by peer referrals.<sup>314</sup> Peer referrals are a sign of trust and the creation of a larger relational network as clients refer their friends. Outreach is relational and successful outcomes occur through developing a strong rapport between outreach providers and the target community.

Outreach occurs in an ever-changing environment. This requires constant reflection on experiences and analysis of interactions. The team framework provides sounding boards, information sharing, and additional perspectives through which to view the outreach landscape. Outreach ministry is both experiential and relational, and needs to be consistent and yet continually adapted to meet needs. A team approach insists experiences are shared in ways that fosters continual conversation about how needs are met. Having a team approach to outreach creates accountability and safety both for the outreach team and for the population the outreach team engages with. It was observed of street outreach programs that:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>309</sup> Connolly and Joly, "Outreach with street-involved youth," 259.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>310</sup> Ibid., 531.

<sup>311</sup> Rabinovitch, "PEERS," 241.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>312</sup> Connolly and Joly, "Outreach with street-involved youth," 525.

<sup>313</sup> Ibid

<sup>314</sup> Saldanha and Parenteau, "Well, if you can't smile you should go home!" 1277.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>315</sup> Ibid., 1276.

Most programs use a team of two workers together on the street, preferably one man and one woman. The team approach is safer and enables more than one person to have contact and knowledge about each young person who is engaged.<sup>316</sup>

A team approach to outreach offers greater relational support to each individual met through outreach. There is a shared knowledge and experience that comes from a team approach. The relationship and trust established amongst the outreach team is crucial and impacts those they engage with and the outreach program as a whole.<sup>317</sup> Outreach partners that trust each other implicitly show the community they serve that they can be trusted.

Outreach ministry requires a patient presence; respect is conveyed through patiently awaiting readiness for change. Outreach is a form of active waiting, as individuals who are street-involved want to know that there is a worker who is ready, willing, and able to help.<sup>318</sup> When individuals have constantly been faced with experiences of disappointment and discouragement, then belief and readiness for change can take time.<sup>319</sup> An outreach ministry that actively waits is a ministry of presence that motivates change. Presence means being open and available with authenticity and transparency.<sup>320</sup> Saldanha and Parenteau explain:

Some people will take a long time to be ready and others may never be ready to change. Even then, actively waiting is not a waste of time. A consistent presence in their lives helps keep the desire to change alive and gives them hope. Relationship and connection honour dignity in the here and now.<sup>321</sup>

A patient and consistent presence conveys respect and dignity. An outreach program that understands the importance of active waiting, rather than urgent outcomes acknowledges the experiences of individuals who are street-involved.<sup>322</sup> Actively waiting is an act of faith and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>316</sup> Able-Peterson and Bucy, *The Street Outreach Training Manual*, 50.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>317</sup> Ibid., 45, 47, 50.

<sup>318</sup> Saldanha and Parenteau, "Well, if you can't smile you should go home!" 1278.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>319</sup> Ibid., 1277, 1278.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>320</sup> Yaconelli, Contemplative Youth Ministry, 22.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>321</sup> Saldanha and Parenteau, "Well, if you can't smile you should go home!" 1278-1279.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>322</sup> Ibid., 1283.

trust, it is letting God be God; yielding to what God is already doing rather building or creating. 323 Active waiting motivates change and nurtures hope.

#### 4.2. Qualities of Effective Outreach

Outreach ministries and programs examined in the research tend to share common qualities. The qualities of an effective outreach ministry include consistency, relationship building, and trust.

These qualities are interrelated and mutually dependent. Consistency leads to familiarity between the outreach provider and the community members, which makes relationship possible.

Relationships build trust, which in turn open the doors to empowerment and transformation.

Consistency is crucial in an outreach ministry. Creating a consistent time and place for outreach builds familiarity between the outreach provider and the community served.<sup>324</sup> This shows the community served that the outreach workers and program can be depended upon for support. A consistent presence matters more than the size of the program. Able-Peterson and Bucy observed, "Even if street workers begin on a small scale by going out for a few hours twice a week as long as their presence and hours worked out in the community are consistent, smaller communities can begin to address the problems."<sup>325</sup> Consistency is not only about the time, place, and people; it is also about outreach providers having a consistent attitude. <sup>326</sup> Showing a spirit of consistent generosity is a vital quality in effective and pastoral outreach ministry.

Pamela Couture describes this phenomenon, stating:

A spirit of consistent generosity that continues even when it is not returned, however, is so unexpected that once a person begins to sense that such generosity is present, it will evoke some kind of challenge, some kind of testing. All of us have doubted love; all of us have

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>323</sup> Yaconelli, Contemplative Youth Ministry, 72.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>324</sup> Able-Peterson and Bucy, *The Street Outreach Training Manual*, 56, 64.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>325</sup> Able-Peterson and Bucy, *The Street Outreach Training Manual*, 35.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>326</sup> Saldanha and Parenteau, "'Well, if you can't smile you should go home!" 1278.

tested it; and most of us have been the recipients of human love that survived our challenge.<sup>327</sup>

The childhood experiences of disappointment, abuse, and exploitation that are common amongst individuals involved in prostitution have lacked a spirit of consistent generosity. Past relationships have not survived challenge and have thus led to disappointment; a spirit of consistent generosity survives challenge and builds relationship.

In an effective outreach ministry it is of the utmost importance to build strong relationships between the outreach provider and the community member being reached; this was emphasized consistently in the research. A respectful and trusting relationship is part of the very definition of outreach and necessary for pastoral engagement. Street youth respond when relationships with workers are informed by compassion and respect. This relationship is formed through seemingly small gestures, which convey consistency, respect and trust. Connolly and Joly state,

It is vital for workers to remember the importance of mutual trust, confidentiality and respect when interacting with street-involved youth. Seemingly small acts, such as remembering a youth's name, can go a long way in attempting to engage them in services. Without the presence of a strong therapeutic relationship, youth are unlikely to trust a worker enough to participate in a program.<sup>331</sup>

Small gestures that consistently convey respect and trust are the foundation of a therapeutic relationship. <sup>332</sup> Through this relationship, outreach workers become a bridge to the services, self-esteem, and dignity needed as individuals work to rebuild their lives. <sup>333</sup> The outreach

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>327</sup> Couture, Seeing Children, Seeing God, 75.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>328</sup> Connolly and Joly, "Outreach with street-involved youth," 531.

<sup>329</sup> Karabanow, Being Young and Homeless, 91.

<sup>330</sup> Saldanha and Parenteau, "Well, if you can't smile you should go home!" 1280.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>331</sup> Connolly and Joly, "Outreach with street-involved youth," 532.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>332</sup> Ibid., 529.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>333</sup> Able-Peterson and Bucy, *The Street Outreach Training Manual*, 18.

relationship is formed through consistent, respectful engagement and leads to trust in connecting to resources and services.

Trusting relationships empower transformation. The healing process begins through the establishment of this trusting relationship.<sup>334</sup> Trust is tested and established through validation of that trust. The establishment of trust is formed when outreach workers are ready and able to meet needs and empower further steps. Saldanha and Parenteau explain,

Most people will need to develop enough trust in a worker to ask for help and then have that trust validated by the worker following through to some extent before they will make that decision to trust the organization the worker represents. Consequently, a good outreach program and a good outreach worker, will be prepared to do the necessary follow through fairly independently until a referral can be made successfully. 335

Trust is essential in being able to make referrals and connect young people involved in the sex trade to programs, services, and supports. The trusting relationship formed with the outreach worker shows the community member that someone believes change is possible. The trusting relationship is transformative by connecting community members to resources and nurturing hope.

#### 4.3. Outreach as Living out Missio Dei

Outreach is reaching out in love to respond generously to the needs of the community. Meeting the needs of people where they are and how they express those needs is sharing the gospel. As basic needs are met, consistent, trusting, and empowering relationships form. Outreach is a response to being sent. This sending is God's and is reflection of the sending of the persons of the Trinity, the *missio Dei*.<sup>337</sup> Outreach ministry is not an activity the Church *does*, but rather the

<sup>334</sup> Ibid 19

<sup>335</sup> Saldanha and Parenteau, "Well, if you can't smile you should go home!" 1280.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>336</sup> Ibid., 1282.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>337</sup> Barth, "Theology and Mission in Present Times," 19.

essence of what a church *is*. Hoekendijk expresses the relationship of church to God's mission, stating:

A church that knows that she is a function of the apostolate and that her very ground of existence lies in the proclamation of the Kingdom to the world, does not engage in missions, but she herself *becomes* mission, she becomes the living outreach of God to the world. That is why a church without mission is an absurdity.<sup>338</sup>

The Church, according to Hoekendijk, is the living outreach of God to the world. Having a deeper understanding of the principles and qualities of outreach can help the Church to better understand itself as a function of the apostolate. Mission is not a program of the Church, but rather the essential meaning and purpose of the Church.

# 5. Empowered and Transformed: Exits and After-care

Exiting the sex trade requires empowerment more than rescue. Arresting the traffickers, pimps, and johns who sexually exploit young people is important, but it alone does not transform lives. Empowering sexually exploited individuals is profound, as they come to see themselves as heroes in their own story. The psycho-social dimension of the survivor role offers a sense of belonging and control to young women who have been exploited. Empowerment affirms the individual, by believing in their strengths. Empowerment once adopted tends to expand the survivor's resources. Communities of embrace give voice and empower strengths.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>338</sup> J. C. Hoekendijk, *The Church Inside Out*, ed. L.A. Hoedemaker and Peter Tijimes, trans. Isaac C. Rottenberg, (Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1966), 43.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>339</sup> Christie Cozad Neuger, *Counseling Women: A Narrative Pastoral Approach*, (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 2001), 83-85, 91.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>340</sup> Coy, "Young Women, Local Authority Care, and Selling Sex," 1421.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>341</sup> Julian Rappaport, "Terms of Empowerment/Exemplars of Prevention: Toward a Theory for Community Psychology," *American Journal of Community Psychology* v. 15. no. 2. (1987): 142.

Hope is the cornerstone of empowerment.<sup>342</sup> Scott Larson states, "Hope requires saying yes to a future worth having rather than merely no to that which is not wanted."<sup>343</sup> Many young people involved in the sex trade have never known a future worth having. Childhood experiences of abuse, neglect, and poverty have made it difficult to see the future with hope. When leaving street-life, issues of lack of support, lack of self-worth, boredom and a perception of risk are among the challenges individuals face.<sup>344</sup> Relationships of trust and support help to confront and overcome these challenges. Having an outreach provider who hopes with the young person and believes that they are worthy of a future worth having is transformative. Empowering exits means understanding the motivation for change and the power of shame in denying hope. The *missio Dei* seeks liberation: an empowerment, which transforms and transcends is what God desires for all of creation.

### 5.1. Motivation for Change

Empowering a young person involved in the sex trade to be able "to say yes to future worth having," requires understanding how they envision such a future. The changes sought after could include exiting the sex trade, going to school, working towards sobriety, or decisions surrounding harm reduction. When researchers asked individuals involved in the sex trade what they needed, 95% of the Canadian respondents said they needed to leave prostitution. Through understanding what is at stake in exiting street-life and clearly articulating the motivation for change and the barriers to change, a pastoral care provider can better respond to the needs of the individual seeking change.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>342</sup> Catherine Feste and Robert M. Anderson, "Empowerment: from philosophy to practice," *Patient Education and Counseling* 26 (1995): 141-142.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>343</sup> Scott Larson, "The Power of Hope," *Reclaiming Children and Youth* 21, no. 4 (2013): 45.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>344</sup> Volpe, Talwar, and Hunter, *Juvenile "Prostitution" in Toronto*, 16.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>345</sup> Farley et al. "Prostitution and Trafficking in Nine Countries," 51.

Purpose is necessary in the process of leaving the street. The pursuit of a goal, having a baby, having someone to trust, gaining employment, or seeking stability are examples of such purpose. 346 In one study, almost all respondents had attempted to leave prostitution at least once as adolescents. 347 For most, this attempt occurred after a significant traumatic event or after becoming pregnant.<sup>348</sup> Change seems to beget change, as those seeking change experienced a myriad of other changes including social network, career development, and educational attainment as they transitioned from street-life. 349 The achievement of goals is part of the transition<sup>350</sup> and contributes to fostering a sense of empowerment.<sup>351</sup> Understanding the purpose behind goals and desires expressed is essential in overcoming tensions between desires and actions. Overcoming these tensions eliminate barriers and optimize the achievement of goals.

The articulation of potential barriers that may threaten the achievement of a survivor's goals is necessary in empowering success over such barriers. When seeking change, there can be a clash between the individual's stated desires and actions. 352 This may be especially true when dealing with trauma. Clear articulation of the threats to goals opens dialogue for problem solving, referrals, accountability, and maximizes the successful achievement of goals. Canadian respondents in one study revealed that there are a variety of barriers that could threaten their achievement of goals.<sup>353</sup> Their needs included drug/alcohol treatment (82%), job training (67%),

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>346</sup> Volpe, Talwar and Hunter, *Juvenile "Prostitution" in Toronto*, 16.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>347</sup> Nixon et al. "The Everyday Occurrence," 1035

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>348</sup> Ibid.; Jeff Karabanow, Alexa Carson, and Philip Clement, Leaving the Streets: Stories of Canadian Youth (Halifax: Fernwood Publishing, 2010), 39, 25. 349 Oselin, "Leaving the Streets," 401.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>350</sup> Ibid., 398.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>351</sup> Ibid., 402.

<sup>352</sup> Sharon S. Oselin, "Leaving the Streets: Transformation of Prostitute Identity Within the Prostitution Rehabilitation Program," Deviant Behavior 30, no. 4 (2009): 393.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>353</sup> Farley et al. "Prostitution and Trafficking in Nine Countries," 51.

home or safe place (66%), individual counselling (58%), and self-defense training (49%). 354

These responses reveal the desire for change, but also illumine some of the barriers or challenges to change, namely addiction, lack of employment, lack of housing, and past trauma. Sustainable and successful exits from street-life involve recognizing and overcoming the barriers to change, and fostering a belief and motivation to change.

#### 5.2. The Power of Shame

The denial of a "future worth having" is cultivated by one's sense of shame. Individuals involved in the sex trade due to sexual exploitation, childhood sexual abuse, and histories of trauma might be experiencing feelings of shame. Shame involves self-blame, estrangement, and alienation.

Shame is a deep internal wound with profound consequences for one's sense of identity. The psychological and spiritual reality of survivors of childhood sexual abuse is organized by shame. Individuals first leaving prostitution tended to spend a lot of time discussing a sense of shame. Many survivors of childhood sexual abuse describe the poignant absence of hope and gracelessness as consequences of the shame they feel. Shame is barrier to exiting street-life as self-criminalization suggests that life on the streets is deserved.

Shame creates barriers in relationships. An abused woman, due to shame and low self-esteem, often believes that forgiveness for herself is beyond her reach.<sup>359</sup> The barriers in relationships created by shame can limit the abilities of the outreach worker or pastoral care provider. Nancy Ramsay speaks about this estrangement:

<sup>354</sup> Ibid

<sup>355</sup> Ramsay, "Sexual Abuse and Shame," 112.

<sup>356</sup> Ramsay, "Sexual Abuse and Shame," 112.

<sup>357</sup> Oselin, "Leaving the Streets," 389.

<sup>358</sup> Ramsay, "Sexual Abuse and Shame," 113.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>359</sup> JoAnn M. Garma, "A Cry of Anguish: The Battered Women," in *Women in Travail and Transition: A New Pastoral Care*, ed. Maxine Glaz and Jeanne Stevenson Moessner (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1991), 134.

The power of shame to undermine the victim's sense of self, her capacity to love and accept herself, her capacity for genuinely giving and receiving love seriously erodes her capacity for religious belief and healthy spirituality. Shame engenders deep estrangement within the self and between the self and others - sometimes between the victim and God. 360

Overcoming shame requires reconciling this deep estrangement through relationships of trust and hope. Estrangement is overcome by connection to an affirming community of embrace.

#### 5.3. A Community of Embrace

The estrangement stemming from the shame of sexual violence is overcome by connectedness. Support is essential for transformation, as many desiring to leave prostitution felt incapable of doing so on their own. 361 In interviews with former street youth, each one mentioned at least one person they had been able to count upon for support as they exited street life. 362 Intensive emotional and practical support can help young women in finding a positive and healthy sense of belonging. 363 Shame from sexual violence fosters a deep spiritual hurt. 364 The locus of violation is within the body itself when sexual violence occurs leading to a feeling of alienation from one's bodied self. 365 This, along with ambivalence and anger towards God for leaving sexually abused persons unprotected, has spiritual implications. <sup>366</sup> Seeking a healthy spirituality rooted in connectedness is necessary for survivors of sexual violence. Nancy Ramsay explains,

Rebuilding a healthy spirituality does not mean that religious faith is necessary for recovery. It does mean that to thrive people need a sense of connectedness with the human community that is life-giving and that gives a larger meaning and purpose to their lives beyond their own efforts.<sup>367</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>361</sup> Oselin, "Leaving the Streets," 388.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>362</sup> Karabanow, Carson and Clement, *Leaving the Streets*, 49.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>363</sup> Cov, "Young Women, Local Authority Care, and Selling Sex," 1421.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>364</sup> Ramsay, "Sexual Abuse and Shame," 113.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>365</sup> Ibid.; Coy, "Young Women, Local Authority Care, and Selling Sex," 1409, 1419. <sup>366</sup> Ramsay, "Sexual Abuse and Shame," 119.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>367</sup> Ibid., 115.

Connectedness is necessary for empowering healing and transformation. Advice, judgment, theological platitudes, and simplistic reassurances are lacking when it comes to overcoming shame. 368 Shame is transformed through the experience of connection with God's love. 369 Being truly seen, listened to, received, and loved is transformative for young people and an embodiment of the presence of Jesus.<sup>370</sup> Sharing in one's journey by being a pastoral and theological presence offers the gift of transforming hope.<sup>371</sup> Being a community of embrace means consistent presence and constant love.

Having one's story heard and being able to create a new, more positive narrative is empowering and transformative.<sup>372</sup> It is transformative to be heard and believed in the face of exploitation. Helping individuals who have been hurt to be heard in their lives helps them to believe they have the right to be heard and believed. <sup>373</sup> Communities that help individuals be heard and become part of a new and more positive narrative help them to transform and embrace a more preferred story, that of future worth having.<sup>374</sup> Christie Cozad Neuger discusses the importance of community in supporting a positive and healing narrative, stating:

Communities and groups that work to hear and elaborate the new and more positive narratives help a woman to make this new narrative a viable part of her life story. With this stronger narrative strand, a woman is more likely to continue gathering evidence that will support that preferred story rather than allow the problem story to take over her life again. 375

Communities seeking to embrace individuals who have been exploited can help them to embrace a new, hope-filled narrative in their lives. Through hearing and framing the narrative with

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>368</sup> Dean and Cullen, "Woman's Body," 104.
<sup>369</sup> Ramsay, "Sexual Abuse and Shame," 120.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>370</sup> Yaconelli, Contemplative Youth Ministry, 101-102.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>371</sup> Dean and Cullen, "Woman's Body," 104.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>372</sup> Neuger, Counseling Women, 89, 91.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>373</sup> Ibid., 80.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>374</sup> Ibid., 234.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>375</sup> Ibid., 234.

evidence of strength and hope, the individual is empowered, as their story becomes one of transformation.

The doctrine of the Trinity asserts that God in God's very nature is community. The love of God is experienced in its fullest in community. The Church must seek to embody and offer God's love in and for the community. Kenda Creasy Dean discusses the importance of communities that practice God's passionate love, stating:

Youth ministry must invite young people into communities that practice passion - not just any passion, but God's passion - through acts of worship and witness that invite us to love foolishly, and to suffer love's consequences as we seek after God's own heart.<sup>376</sup>

Communities of embrace must practice passion, seeking to embody and express God's love. The experience of connection with the gracious love of God transforms and empowers.<sup>377</sup>

Transformation comes from the love of God experienced in and reflected by the community as it reaches out to embrace.

#### 5.4. Missio Dei, Transformation and Empowerment

God's mission at work in the world is a mission, which seeks liberation and healing for creation.

Jesus models the transformative power of loving presence in the relationships he has with people. Mark Yaconelli discusses Jesus' relational ministry, stating:

Jesus' presence, his capacity to love and be with people is transformative. You can see it in the way he listens, shares food, spends time, weeps, walks, touches, responds and cares for others. Jesus enjoys being with people. He enjoys being with God. His ministry, it seems doesn't come from a pre-planned formula but instead arises in response to the real situations and relationships he encounters.<sup>378</sup>

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>376</sup> Dean, *Practicing Passion*, 26.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>377</sup> Ramsay, "Sexual Abuse and Shame," 120.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>378</sup> Yaconelli, Contemplative Youth Ministry, 21.

Jesus was truly present with people in the realities and situations of their lives. Transformative ministry occurs when the community seeks to live into and live out the presence of Jesus.<sup>379</sup> Living out the love of God made known in the presence of Jesus is at the heart of mission.

The empowerment and transformation of those who have experienced sexual exploitation is part of the *missio Dei*. Moltmann discusses the profound importance of liberation to God, stating:

The eschatological meaning of the messianic mission of Christ and the Spirit lies in the glorifying of God and the liberation of the world, in the sense that God is glorified through the liberation and healing of creation, and that he does not desire to be glorified without his liberated creation.<sup>380</sup>

The glorification of God requires liberation and healing. Being a community of embrace, which motivates change and confronts shame, is the Church's calling. Moltmann further states, "The church participates in the glorifying of God in creation's liberation...The true church is the song of thanksgiving of those who have been liberated." The liberating empowerment and embrace of those who have experienced sexual exploitation is not an option for the Church, but a necessity in what true church means

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>379</sup> Ibid

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>380</sup> Moltmann, *The Church in the Power of the Spirit,* 60.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>381</sup> Ibid., 65.

# Chapter 4 Concluding Thoughts

# 1. Concluding Remarks

This paper examines the realities of juvenile prostitution in Canada and presents a pastoral, practical, and missional response to those realities. As an examination of these realities in the second chapter, I assess the risk factors that characterize juvenile sexual exploitation. The risk factors are found to be external and situated outside the control of the young women involved. Juvenile recruitment is the dominant reality in Canada's sex-trade, and the entry age has become progressively younger over the last 30 years, now 13-14 years old. Women and girls, particularly Aboriginal women and girls, are grossly overrepresented within the sex trade. Gynecological issues, violence, substance abuse, and psycho-spiritual concerns are among the risks the sex trade poses to health of the young women involved. The sex industry is driven by demand and the attitudes of purchasers. Pimps and traffickers play a significant role in the recruitment, coercion, and exploitation of young people. In response to the issues raises by Bedford et al, it is important to explore the impact of legalization on juvenile prostitution outside of Canada. In so doing, it can be concluded that legalization has significantly increased child sex trafficking in the countries where such laws were implemented.

The traditional response of the Church towards prostitution has been one of "othering," it is necessary to move to a position of "embrace," which seeks understanding. Embrace seeks to understand and empower, rather than to rescue or save. Embracing young people by fostering resiliency through youth ministry is a way of strengthening them against the environmental risk factors, which may lead to prostitution. Outreach is reaching out in love to meet another where

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>382</sup> Task Force on Trafficking of Women and Girls in Canada, *From Heartbreaking to Groundbreaking*, 3.

they are and is how the Church must respond to young people involved in prostitution.

Responding to the needs of those involved in the sex-trade as they identify their needs is at the heart of outreach and empowerment. The provision of pastoral care can lead a young person to seek to exit the sex trade, which requires empowerment and transformation. Hope for the future is the cornerstone of that empowerment. A community of embrace is necessary for overcoming shame and estrangement, and helping to transform one's narrative. Liberation from shame, estrangement, and exploitation through empowerment and transformation is intimately tied to the messianic mission.

# 2. Gaps in the Research: Gendered Research

The vast majority of available research on prostitution focuses on the prostitution of women and girls. There is a dearth in available research on the experiences of boys, men, and transgender individuals involved in the sex-trade in Canada and elsewhere. In the future, scholarship should account for this gap through conducting research that compares the gendered realities of prostitution in Canada. It is difficult at present to know how the prostitution of women and girls in Canada differs or is similar to the prostitution of boys, men, and transgender individuals in terms of recruitment, violence experienced, and psycho-spiritual concerns.

# 3. Hope for the Future in Countering Juvenile Prostitution in Canada

The news media headlines at the beginning of this paper were intended not only to shine light on the reality of juvenile prostitution in Canada, but also on how law enforcement is responding to this reality. Rescue alone cannot sustain a healthy exit from the sex-trade. The awareness of the Church and Canadian Society to the realities of young people being sexually exploited through the sex-trade allow for the confrontation of apathy and movement to embrace. Organizations

throughout Canada, such as ARISE, Covenant House, and the Canadian Women's Foundation are actively working to address juvenile prostitution and empower survivors. The new prostitution laws are too recent for their impact on juvenile prostitution in Canada to have been thoroughly researched and understood. Building a future worth having, which sees the end of juvenile prostitution in Canada, requires the Church and Canadian society to say "yes" to working toward that goal together.

#### Bibliography

- Able-Peterson, Trudee and June Bucy. *The Street Outreach Training Manual*. Washington: US Department of Health and Human Services, 1993.
- Aichhorn, August. Wayward Youth: A Psychoanalytic Study of Delinquent Children. New York: Meridian Books, 1957.
- Aquinas. Summa Theologica: First Complete American Edition in Three Volumes, Volume 2. Translated by Fathers of the English Dominican Province. New York: Benziger Brothers, 1947.
- The Archbishops' Council. *Mission-Shaped Church: Church Planting and Fresh Expressions of Church in a Changing Context.* London: Church House Publishing, 2004.
- ARISE Ministry. "Home." *ARISE Ministry*. https://ariseministry.wordpress.com/home/ (accessed January 4, 2016).
- ARISE Ministry. "Our Story." *ARISE Ministry*. https://ariseministry.wordpress.com/our-story/ (accessed January 4, 2016).
- Augustine. *On Order [De Ordine]*. Translated by Silvanno Borrusso. South Bend: St. Augustine's Press, 2007.
- Bagley, Christopher. "Adolescent prostitution in Canada and the Philippines: Statistical comparisons, an ethnographic account and policy options." *International Social Work* 42, no. 4. (1999): 445-454.
- Barth, Karl. "Theology and Mission in Present Times." *Speech delivered to the Bradenburg Mission Conference*. Translated by Karsten Decker. Berlin, 1932.
- Bartley, Paula. *Prostitution: Prevention and Reform in England, 1860-1914.* London: Routledge, 2000.
- Benard, Bonnie. Fostering Resiliency in Kids: Protective Factors in the Family, School and Community. Portland: Northwest Regional Educational Laboratory, 1991.
- Bosch, David J. *Transforming Mission: Paradigm Shifts in Theology of Mission*. Maryknoll: Orbis Books, 1991.
- Brendtro, Larry K., Martin Brokenleg and Steve Van Bockern. *Reclaiming Youth At Risk: Our Hope for the Future, Revised Edition*. Bloomington: Solution Tree, 2002.
- Brendtro, Larry K. and Scott J. Larson. *The Resilience Revolution: Discovering Strengths in Challenging Kids*. Bloomington: Solution Tree Press, 2006.
- Brendtro, Larry and Mary Shahbazian. *Troubled Children and Youth: Turning Problems into Opportunities*. Illinois: Research Press, 2004.

- Brock, Rita Nakashima and Susan Brooks Thistlethwaite. *Casting Stones: Prostitution and Liberation in Asia and the United States*. Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1996.
- Brokenleg, Martin. "The Resilience Revolution: Our Original Collaboration." *Reclaiming Children and Youth* v. 18, no. 4. (2010): 8-11.
- Brokenleg, Martin. "Native American Perspectives on Generosity." *Reclaiming Children and Youth* 8, no. 2 (1999): 66-68.
- Cameron, Stevie. On the Farm: Robert William Pickton and the Tragic Story of Vancouver's Mission Women. Toronto: Vintage Canada, 2011.
- Canada (Attorney General) v. Bedford. 2013 SCC 72, 3 S.C.R. 1101, (SCC 2013). https://scc-csc.lexum.com/scc-csc/scc-csc/en/item/13389/index.do (accessed July 17, 2015).
- Canada Without Poverty. "Just the Facts." *Canada Without Poverty*, 2015. http://www.cwp-csp.ca/poverty/just-the-facts/ (accessed December 21, 2015).
- Canadian Association of Elizabeth Fry Societies. *Juvenile Prostitution: A Look at Badgley and Fraser*. Ottawa: Canadian Association of Elizabeth Fry Societies, 1985.
- Canadian Press. "Harper says no inquiry into missing and murdered aboriginal women." *News* 1130. October 6, 2015. http://www.news1130.com/2015/10/06/harper-says-no-inquiry-into-missing-and-murdered-aboriginal-women/ (accessed January 5, 2016).
- CBC News. "Aboriginal women still overrepresented among Canada's missing and murdered women." *CBC*, June 19, 2015. http://www.cbc.ca/news/aboriginal/aboriginal-women-still-overrepresented-among-canada-s-missing-and-murdered-women-1.3120272 (accessed July 13, 2015).
- Chambers, J.C. and Mark Freado. "Kid Whispering and the Inside Kid." *Reclaiming Children and Youth* 17, no. 4 (2009): 41-45.
- Connolly, J.A. and L.E. Joly, "Outreach with street-involved youth: A quantitative and qualitative review of the literature." *Clinical Psychology Review* 32 (2012): 524-534
- Couture, Pamela. *Child Poverty: Love, Justice and Social Responsibility*. St. Louis: Chalice Press, 2007.
- Couture, Pamela. Seeing Children, Seeing God: A Practical Theology of Children and Poverty. Nashville: Abingdon Press, 2000.
- Couture, Pamela D. *Blessed Are The Poor? Women's Poverty, Family Policy and Practical Theology.* Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1991.

- Coy, Maddy. "Young Women, Local Authority Care and Selling Sex: Findings from Research" *British Journal of Social Work* 38 (2008): 1408-1424.
- Cross, Jessica Smith. "Human trafficking probe involving 31 young girls leads to 10 arrests," *Toronto Metro*, February 19, 2014, http://www.metronews.ca/news/toronto/2014/02/19/human-trafficking-probe-involving-30-young-girls-leads-to-10-arrests.html (accessed January 29, 2016).
- Dean, Kenda Creasy. *Practicing Passion: Youth and the Quest for a Passionate Church*. Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2004.
- Dean, Mary James and Mary Louise Cullen. "Woman's Body: Spiritual need and theological presence." In *Women in Travail and Transition: A New Pastoral Care*, edited by Maxine Glaz and Jeanne Stevenson Moessner, 86-108. Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1991.
- Dube, Shanta R., Vincent J. Felitti, Maxia Dong, Wayne Giles and Robert F. Anda. "The impact of adverse childhood experiences on health problems: evidence from cohorts dating back to 1900." *Preventative Medicine* 37 (2003): 268-277.
- Edwards, Valerie J., George W. Holden, Vincent J. Felitti, and Robert F. Anda. "Relationship Between Multiple Forms of Childhood Maltreatment and Adult Mental Health in Community Respondents: Results From the Adverse Childhood Experiences Study." *The American Journal of Psychiatry* 160, no. 8 (2003): 1453-1460.
- Everson, Thomas J. "From Risk to Resiliency: Faith Skills for the Journey." In *The Ongoing Journey: Awakening Spiritual Life in At- Risk Youth*, edited by Terry Hyland and Ron Herron, 207-217. Boys Town: Boys Town Press, 1995.
- Farley, Melissa. "Bad for the Body, Bad for the Heart': Prostitution Harms Women Even if Legalized on Decriminalized." *Violence Against Women* 10, no.10. (2004): 1087-1125.
- Farley, Melissa, Ann Cotton, Jacqueline Lynne, Sybille Zumbeck, Frida Spiwak, Maria E. Reyes, Dinorah Alvarez, and Ufuk Sezgin. "Prostitution and Trafficking in Nine Countries: An Update on Violence and Posttraumatic Stress Disorder." *Journal of Trauma and Practice* 2, no. 3/4 (2003): 33-74.
- Farley, Melissa, Jan MacLeod, Lynn Anderson and Jacqueline M. Golding. "Attitudes and Social Characteristics of Men Who Buy Sex in Scotland." *Psychological Trauma: Theory, Research, Practice and Policy* v. 3 no. 4. (2011): 369-383.
- Feinberg, Leslie. *Transgender Liberation: A Movement Whose Time Has Come*. Lexington: Women's International Network News Quarterly, 1992.
- Fensham, Charles. *Emerging from the Dark Age Ahead: The Future of the North American Church*. Toronto: Clements Academic, 2011.

- Feste, Catherine and Robert M. Anderson, "Empowerment: from philosophy to practice," *Patient Education and Counseling* v. 26 (1995): 139-144.
- Gaetz, Stephen and Bill O'Grady. "Making money: exploring the economy of young homeless workers." *Work, Employment and Society* 16, no. 3. (2002):433-456.
- Garma, JoAnn M. "A Cry of Anguish: The Battered Woman." In *Women in Travail and Transition: A New Pastoral Care*, edited by Maxine Glaz and Jeanne Stevenson Moessner, 126-145. Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1991.
- Gibbs Van Brunschot, Erin and Augustine Brannigan. "Childhood maltreatment and subsequent conduct disorders: The case of female street prostitution." *International Journal of Law and Psychiatry* 25 (2002): 219-234.
- GLAAD, "GLAAD Media Reference Guide Transgender Issues," http://www.glaad.org/reference/transgender/ (accessed April 1, 2016).
- Glaz, Maxine, and Jeanne Stevenson Moessner. "Travail as Transition." In *Women in Travail and Transition: A New Pastoral Care*, edited by Maxine Glaz and Jeanne Stevenson Moessner, 187-197. Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1991.
- Graham, John R. "William Lyon Mackenzie King, Elizabeth Harvie, and Edna: A Prostitute Rescuing Initiative in Late Victorian Toronto." *The Canadian Journal of Human Sexuality* 8, no. 1 (1999): 47-60.
- Halberstam, Judith. *In a Queer Time and Place: Transgender Bodies, Subcultural Lives.* New York: New York University Press, 2005.
- Harris, Maria. Portrait of Youth Ministry. New York: Paulist Press, 1981.
- Hebblethwaite, Cordelia. "#BBCTrending: #RealMenDontBuyGirls and the #BringBackOurGirls campaign." *BBC Trending*, May 8, 2014. http://www.bbc.com/news/blogs-trending-27328414 (accessed July 17, 2015).
- Hestenes, Mark. "The early Browning: Pastoral Care in a pluralistic age and the method of practical moral inquiry," *HTS Teologies Studies/Theological Studies* 68, no. 2 (2012): 1-7. http://www.hts.org.za/index.php/HTS/article/viewFile/1211/2374 (accessed December 12, 2015).
- Hoekendijk, J.C. *The Church Inside Out*. Edited by L.A. Hoedemaker and Peter Tijimes, Translated by Isaac C. Rottenberg. Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1966.
- International Justice Mission. "Where We Work." *IJM.* https://www.ijm.org/where-we-work (accessed July 17, 2015).
- International Labour Organization. 21 Million People Are Now Victims Of Forced Labour, ILO

- Says. 2012. http://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/newsroom/news/WCMS\_181961/lang-en/index.htm. (accessed December 19, 2015).
- Kagi, Ruth and Debbie Regala. "Translating the Adverse Childhood Experiences (ACE) Study Into Public Policy: Progress and Possibility in Washington State." *Journal of Prevention and Intervention in the Community* 40 (2012): 271-277.
- Karabanow, Jeff. Being Young and Homeless: Understanding How Youth Enter and Exit Street Life. New York: Peter Lang Publishing, 2008.
- Karabanow, Jeff, Alexa Carson, and Philip Clement. *Leaving the Streets: Stories of Canadian Youth.* Halifax: Fernwood Publishing, 2010.
- Kavner, Lucas. "Ashton Kutcher and Demi Moore Launch 'Real Men Don't Buy Girls' Campaign (VIDEO)." *HuffPost Impact*, April 11, 2011. http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2011/04/11/ashton-kutcher-demi-moore-trafficking n 847291.html (accessed July 17, 2015).
- Kennedy, M. Alexis, Carolin Klein, Jessica T.K. Bristowe, Barry S. Cooper, and John C. Yuille. "Routes of Recruitment: Pimps' Techniques and Other Circumstances That Lead to Street Prostitution." *Journal of Aggression, Maltreatment & Trauma* 15, no. 2 (2007): 1-19.
- King, Larry L., Peter Masterton, and Colin Higgins. *The Best Little Whorehouse in Texas*. DVD. Directed by Colin Higgins. Willowdale: Universal Studios, 1982.
- Krüger Kjaer, Susanne, Edith I. Svare, Anne Marie Worm, Jan M. M. Walboomers, Chris J. L. M. Meijer, and Adriaan J. C. Van Den Brule. "Human Papillomavirus Infection in Danish Female Sex Workers: Decreasing Prevalence with Age Despite Continuously High Sexual Activity." *Sexually Transmitted Diseases* 27, no. 8. (2000): 438-445.
- Larson, Scott. "The Power of Hope." Reclaiming Children and Youth v. 21 no. 4 (2013): 44-46.
- Larson, Scott and Larry Brendtro. *Reclaiming Our Prodigal Sons and Daughters: A Practical Approach for Connecting with Youth in Conflict*. Bloomington: Solution Tree, 2000.
- Lee, Sang Taek. *Religion and Social Formation in Korea: Minjung and Millenarianism.* Berlin: Mouton de Gruyter, 1996.
- Leslie, Keith. "Ontario will follow prostitution law despite concerns, says Kathleen Wynne." *Toronto Star,* December 19, 2014. http://www.thestar.com/news/canada/2014/12/19/ontario\_will\_follow\_prostitution\_law\_despite\_concerns\_says\_kathleen\_wynne.html (accessed July 17, 2015).
- Lowrey, Annie. "In-Depth Report Details Economics of Sex Trade." *The New York Times*, March 12, 2014. http://www.nytimes.com/2014/03/12/us/in-depth-report-details-economics-of-sex-trade.html (accessed March 13, 2014).

MacCharles, Tonda. "Supreme Court prostitution case: Judges challenge government to justify brothel ban." *Toronto Star*, June 13, 2013. http://www.thestar.com/news/canada/2013/06/13/supreme\_court\_prostitution\_case\_judges\_challenge\_government\_to\_justify\_brothel\_ban.html (accessed July 8, 2015).

- MacKay, Peter. "Protection of Communities and Exploited Persons Act." Speech, House of Commons Debates, 41<sup>st</sup> Parliament, 2<sup>nd</sup> Session, Ottawa, June 11, 2014. http://www.parl.gc.ca/HousePublications/Publication.aspx?DocId=6663588&Language=E& Mode=1 (accessed: July 17, 2015).
- Malarek, Victor. *The Johns: Sex for Sale and the Men Who Buy It.* New York: Arcade Publishing, 2011.
- McCarthy, Shawn. "Trudeau urges 'evidence-based approach' on marijuana, prostitution laws." *Globe and Mail,* January 4, 2015. http://www.theglobeandmail.com/news/politics/trudeau-urges-evidence-based-approach-on-marijuana-prostitution-laws/article22285641/ (accessed July 8, 2015).
- MCIS Language Services. *Helping Trafficked Persons: Resource Handbook for Service Providers*. Toronto: MCIS Language Services, 2014.
- Metro. "Ottawa police rescue 15- and 16-year-old girls who had been forced into sex trade." *Ottawa Metro*, June 24, 2015, http://www.metronews.ca/news/ottawa/2015/06/24/ottawa-police-rescue-15-and-16-year-old-girls-who-had-been-forced-into-sex-trade.html (accessed January 29, 2016).
- Miller-McLemore, Bonnie J. "The Contributions of Practical Theology." In *The Willey-Blackwell Companion to Practical Theology*, edited by Bonnie J. Miller-McLemore, 1-20. Malden: Willey-Blackwell, 2012.
- Mitchell, Marty, Christi Tobin, and John Seita. "Principles Undergirding Healthy People," In *In Whose Best Interest? One Child's Odyssey, a Nation's Responsibility,* edited by John Seita, Martin Mitchell, and Christi Tobin, 93-107. Elizabethtown: Continental Press, 1996.
- Moltmann, Jürgen. *The Church in the Power of the Spirit: A Contribution to Messianic Ecclesiology,* translated by Margaret Kohl, Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1993.
- Moore, Mary Elizabeth Mullino. "Yearnings, Hopes, and Visions: Youth Dreams and Ministry Futures." In *Children, Youth, and Spirituality in a Troubling World,* edited by Mary Elizabeth Moore and Almeda M. Wright, 108-122. St. Louis: Chalice Press, 2008.
- Nadon, Susan M., Catherine Koverola, and Eduard H. Schuldermann. "Antecedents to Prostitution: Childhood Victimization." *Journal of Interpersonal Violence* 13, no. 2 (1998): 206-221.
- National Consultation on Adolescent Prostitution. *Proceedings of the National Consultation on Adolescent Prostitution*. Ottawa: Canadian Child Welfare Association, 1987.
- Neuger, Christie Cozad. Counseling Women: A Narrative Pastoral Approach. Minneapolis: Augsburg Fortress Press, 2001.

- Nixon, Kendra, Leslie Tutty, Pamela Downe, Kelly Gorkoff and Jane Ursel. "The Everyday Occurrence: Violence in the Lives of Girls Exploited Through Prostitution." *Violence Against Women* 8, no. 9 (2002): 1016-1043.
- O'Connor, Ann Marie. *Women Working in Prostitution: Towards A Healthier Future*. Dublin: Women's Education Research and Resource Centre, 1996.
- Oselin, Sharon S. "Leaving the Streets: Transformation of Prostitute Identity Within the Prostitution Rehabilitation Program." Deviant Behavior v. 30 no. 4 (2009): 379-406.
- Oselin, Sharon S. and Ronald Weitzer. "Organizations Working on Behalf of Prostitutes." *Sexualities* 16, no. 3/4 (2013): 445-466.
- Parliament of Canada. "Summary." *Statutes of Canada 2014*. Ottawa: Parliament of Canada, 2014. http://www.parl.gc.ca/HousePublications/Redirector.aspx?RefererUrl =%2fHousePublications%2fPublication.aspx%3fLanguage%3dE%26Mode%3d1%26DocId% 3d6767128%26File%3d19)&File=19 (accessed July 17, 2015).
- Poisson, Jayme. "Sex worker advocates clash over landmark ruling, *Toronto Star*, March 26, 2012. http://www.thestar.com/news/gta/2012/03/26/sex\_worker\_advocates\_clash\_over landmark ruling.html (accessed July 8, 2015).
- powell, john a. "A History of Race and Power." Speech, St. John's Presbyterian Church, Berkeley, CA, November 5, 2014. Quoted in Sara Grossman, "john powell: KPFA Evening Dialogue A History of Race and Power." (November 6, 2014). http://diversity.berkeley.edu/john-powell-kpfa-dialogue-history-race-power (accessed July 13, 2015).
- The Presbytery of East Toronto. "Mission Committee Report" from the *October 1, 2013 Meeting of the Presbytery of East Toronto*, October 1, 2013.
- Rabinovitch, Jannit. "PEERS: The Prostitutes' Empowerment, Education and Resource Society." In *Prostitution, Trafficking and Traumatic Stress*, edited by Melissa Farley, 239-253. Binghamton: Haworth Maltreatment & Trauma Press, 2004
- Ramsay, Nancy J. "Sexual Abuse and Shame: The Travail of Recovery." In *Women in Travail and Transition: A New Pastoral Care*, edited by Maxine Glaz and Jeanne Stevenson Moessner, 109-125. Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1991.
- Rappaport, Julian. "Terms of Empowerment/Exemplars of Prevention: Toward a Theory for Community Psychology." *American Journal of Community Psychology* 15, no. 2 (1987): 121-148.
- Rapport, Deb. "An incredible journey." In *Stories of Mission: Sowing Seeds of Hope*, edited by Heather Chappell and Karen Plater, 8-9. Toronto: The Presbyterian Church in Canada, 2015.

- Ratanak International. "Anti-Exploitation Programs." *Ratanak International: Renew Hope. Restore Cambodia.* http://ratanak.org/projects/exploitation/ (accessed July 17, 2015).
- Ravitch, Diane. The death and life of the great American school system: How testing and choice are undermining education. New York: Basic Books, 2010.
- Ryan, Haley. "Seven underage sex workers identified as part of national operation." *Halifax Metro*, October 8, 2014, http://www.metronews.ca/news/halifax/2014/10/08/seven-underage-sex-workers-identified-in-halifax-as-part-of-national-operation.html (accessed Jan 29, 2016).
- Saldanha, Kennedy Arthur. "It's better to be bad than stupid": An exploratory study on resistance and denial of special education discourses in the narratives of street youth. Toronto: University of Toronto, 2010.
- Saldanha, Kennedy and Derek Parenteau. "Well, if you can't smile you should go home!' Experiences and reflective insights on providing outreach to young sex workers." *Children and Youth Services Review* 35(2013): 1276-1283.
- Sampson, Lauren. "The Obscenities of this Country': Canada v. Bedford and the Reform of Canadian Prostitution Laws." *Duke Journal of Gender Law and Policy* 22, no. 137 (2014): 137-172.
- Search Institute. "40 Developmental Assets for Adolescents." *Search Institute*. Minneapolis: Search Institute, 1997. http://www.search-institute.org/content/40-developmental-assets-adolescents-ages-12-18 (accessed December 1, 2015).
- Seita, John. "Resiliency from the Other Side of the Desk." *Journal of Emotional and Behavioral Problems* 3 no. 2 (1994): 15-18.
- Sher, Julian. Somebody's Daughter: The Hidden Story of America's Prostituted Children and the Battle to Save Them. Chicago: Chicago Review Press, 2013.
- Simon, Rob. "'Starting with What Is': Exploring Response and Responsibility to Student Writing through Collaborative Inquiry." *English Education* 45 no. 2 (2013): 115-146.
- Smith, Dawn, Colleen Varcoe and Nancy Edwards. "Turning Around the Intergenerational Impact of Residential Schools on Aboriginal People: Implications for Health Policy and Practice." *CJNR (Canadian Journal of Nursing Research)* 37, no. 4. (2005): 38-60.
- Special Committee on Pornography and Prostitution (Canada). *Pornography and Prostitution in Canada: Report of the Special Committee on Pornography and Prostitution*. Ottawa: Minister of Supply and Services Canada, 1985.
- Steinmetz, Katy. "Why It's Best to Avoid the Word 'Transgendered." *Time,* December 15, 2014, http://www.time.com/3630965/transgender-transgendered/ (accessed April 1, 2016).

- Stone, Bryan. Evangelism after Christendom: The Theology and Practice of Christian Witness. Grand Rapids: Brazos Press, 2007.
- Stryker, Susan. "(De)Subjugated Knowledges: An Introduction to Transgender Studies." In *The Transgender Studies Reader*, edited by Susan Stryker and Stephen White. 1-17. New York: Routledge, 2006.
- Supreme Court of Canada. "Attorney General of Canada, et al. v. Terri Jean Bedford, et al." *Summary*. December 3, 2012. http://www.scc-csc.gc.ca/case-dossier/info/sum-som-eng.aspx?cas=34788 (accessed July 8, 2015).
- Task Force on Trafficking of Women and Girls in Canada. *From Heartbreaking to Groundbreaking: Stories and Strategies to End Sex Trafficking in Canada*. Toronto: Canadian Women's Foundation, Fall 2014. http://canadianwomensfoundation.uberflip.com/i/395419-cwf-traffickingreport-donor-en-uberflip (accessed December 19, 2015)
- THORN Digital Defenders of Children. "Thorn's Channel." *YouTube*. https://www.youtube.com/user/DNAFoundation (accessed July 17, 2015).
- Tillich, Paul. Systematic Theology: Volume 1. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1951.
- The Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada. *They Came for the Children: Canada, Aboriginal Peoples, and Residential Schools.* Winnipeg: The Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada, 2012.
- Tsedu, Tichakunda. "Hip hop music perpetuates stereotypes." *Gender and Media Diversity Journal: Gender, Popular Culture and Media Freedom* 10 (2012): 22-28.
- United Nations General Assembly, Human Rights Council, Twenty-seventh Session, Agenda item 3, *Report of the Special Rapporteur on the rights of indigenous peoples, James Anaya*, prepared by James Anaya, (A/HRC/27/52/Add.2, 2014).
- Valencia, Richard R. "Conceptualizing the Notion of Deficit Thinking." In *The Evolution of Deficit Thinking: Educational Thought and Practice*, edited by Richard R. Valencia, 1-12. Abingdon: Routledge Falmer, 1997.
- Vanacore, Peter. "Developing a Mentoring Ministry." In *City Lights: Ministry Essentials for Reaching Urban Youth*, edited by Scott Larson and Karen Free, 111-122. Loveland: Group Publishing, 2003.
- Volf, Miroslav. "Embracing the Other." *The Princeton Theological Review* X, no. 2 (Spring 2004): 2-9.
- Volpe, Richard, Shruti Talwar, and Ari Hunter. *Juvenile "Prostitution" in Toronto*. Toronto: Sexual Exploitation Education and Awareness Coalition of Toronto, 2006.

- World Health Organization. "Violence against sex workers and HIV Prevention." *Violence Against Women and HIV/AIDS: Critical Intersections* 3 (2005): 1-6. http://www.who.int/gender/documents/sexworkers.pdf (accessed November 30, 2015).
- Williamson, Celia and Michael Prior. "Domestic Minor Sex Trafficking: A Network of Underground Players in the Midwest." *Journal of Child and Adolescent Trauma* 2 (2009): 46-61.
- Wright, Almeda M. "The Power of Testimonies: Spiritual Formation and Ministering with Youth." In *Children, Youth, and Spirituality in a Troubling World*, edited by Mary Elizabeth Moore and Almeda M. Wright, 182-195. St. Louis: Chalice Press, 2008.
- Yaconelli, Mark. *Contemplative Youth Ministry: Practicing the Presence of Jesus*. Grand Rapids: Youth Specialties, 2006.
- Yust, Karen Marie. "(Non)Cosmetic Ministry: Reclaiming Hope Among Abused Adolescents," In *Children, Youth, and Spirituality in a Troubling World*, edited by Mary Elizabeth Moore and Almeda M. Wright, 123-136. St. Louis: Chalice Press, 2008.